



# JOURNAL OF TURKISH STUDIES

TÜRKLÜK BİLGİSİ ARAŞTIRMALARI

*Edited by  
Yayınlayanlar*

FAHİR İZ • ŞİNASI TEKİN

VOLUME I  
1977

*This volume of the Journal has been subsidized by the  
Center for Middle Eastern Studies of Harvard University*

CAMBRIDGE

THE NAQSHBANDIYYA AND THE *DHIKR-i* ARRA

Joseph Fletcher  
Harvard University

One of the most distinctive features of the Naqshbandiyya is their silent *dhikr*, which has caused them to be known as the Khufiyya (Silent school, properly Khafiyya) and has been the subject of repeated controversies throughout their history.

Nowhere has controversy over the *dhikr* been more acute than in China, where it became a cause for bloodshed and rebellion in the eighteenth century. In 1671 a celebrated Naqshbandī *murshid*, Khoja Āfāq, preached at Sining in northeastern Tibet and obtained the adherence of a Chinese Muslim, whose son, Ma Lai-ch'ih 馬來遲 (1673-1753), spread the Naqshbandī *tarikāt* in northwest China and northeastern Tibet in the first half of the eighteenth century, making it by far the then most important mystical brotherhood in those regions. Later in the century, another Chinese Muslim, Ma Ming-hsin 馬明心 (d. 1781), who seems also to have been initiated into the Naqshbandiyya earlier in his life, energetically spread a *tarikāt* called the Jahriyya (Vocal school) in many of the same places, producing a dispute over whether the *dhikr* should be vocal or silent.

The dispute between the factions (*pang-k'o* 邦克 < Persian *bāng*, "calling [to prayer]"; also called *men-huan* 門宦 < ?) led to fighting, and the fighting led to suppression by the Ch'ing government. After crushing a second revolt in 1784 led by the adherents of Ma Ming-hsin's Jahriyya, or "New Teaching" (Hsin-chiao 新教), the Ch'ing instituted what was virtually an anti-Muslim policy, in which the main sufferers were the followers of Ma Ming-hsin. A corresponding uproar occurred at about the same time in Transoxiana, where a Naqshbandī named

Ṣūfī Islām tried to introduce a vocal *dhikr* among the members of his *tarikāt*. In consequence, the Naqshbandī advocates of silence forced him to move with his followers to Afghanistan.

Meanwhile in China a certain Mu Pa-pa 穆 巴巴, a successor of Ma Ming-hsin, had initiated a man known as the "Grand Master of the Shipyard" (Ch'uan-ch'ang T'ai-yeh 船 廠 太 爺) who was exiled to Kirin province because of his involvement in the upheavals that Ma Ming-hsin's vocal *dhikr* had sparked. Mu also initiated the Grand Master's son Ma erh 馬 二 and his grandson Ma Hua-lung 馬 化 龍 (d. 1871). Before Mu Pa-pa died, he is said to have made Ma Hua-lung his direct successor, and in the 1860's Ma Hua-lung was the principal leader of a rebellion against the Ch'ing empire. At the same time, a Sufi from Shensi named T'o-ming 妥 明, who was evidently connected with Ma Hua-lung, also rebelled against the Ch'ing.

Contemporaneous or nearly contemporaneous eighteenth- and nineteenth-century upheavals were led by members of the Naqshbandiyya in Sinkiang (at Ush Turfan in 1765; by Jahāngīr in 1820-1828; the Seven Khojas in 1847; Walī Khan in 1857; Rāshidīn Khan Khoja at Kucha, 'Abd ar-Raḥmān Ḥaḍrat at Yarkand, the Āfāqiyya at Kashgar, and Mu'azzam Khan in Ili, all in 1864), in India (influence of Shāh Walī Allāh of Delhi at the time of the Afghan invasion in 1761; Sayyid Aḥmad Barēlwī in 1826; Tītū Mīr in 1831; common cause of the Mujāhids with the Indian Mutiny in 1857), and elsewhere;<sup>1</sup> so the nature of the relationship between Ma Ming-hsin's Jahriyya and the Naqshbandiyya is of considerable interest.

Inasmuch as I intend to develop this topic elsewhere, I shall limit myself here to the suggestion that Ma Ming-hsin probably traced his *isnād* back primarily to Aḥmad Yasawī (d. 1166) and secondarily to Bahā'

---

1. See my paper, "Central Asian Sufism and Ma Ming-hsin's New Teaching," in *Proceedings of the Fourth East Asian Altaistic Conference, December 26-31, 1971, Taipei, China*, ed. Ch'en Chieh-hsien (Tainan: Department of History, National Ch'engkung University, 1975), pp. 75-96.

ad-Dīn Muḥammad of Kashgar in the thirteenth century.<sup>2</sup> Ma Ming-hsin may well have transmitted both initiations, Yasawī and Naqshbandī, to his disciples. But one cannot exclude the possibility that Ma Ming-hsin, and therefore his Jahriyya also, belonged to that small sub-group of the Naqshbandiyya who practiced a vocal *dhikr*.

Central Asian sources contain many references to a tarikat known as the Jahriyya - the name borne by Ma Ming-hsin's tarikat in China. These Jahriyya are generally understood to be the same as the Yasawiyya, one of whose most distinctive features is the *dhikr-i arra*, or "sawing remembrance." The identification Jahriyya = Yasawiyya may usually be correct, but one cannot always identify the Jahriyya with the Yasawiyya precisely.<sup>3</sup> Nor was the *dhikr-i arra* an exclusive property of the Yasawiyya. M. F. Köprülü cites a passage from the "Risāla-yi Bāburiyya," written by the famous sixteenth-century Naqshbandī khoja Aḥmad Kāsānī, known as the Makhdūm-i A'ẓam, which says: "The lords of the Naqshbandiyya have preferred the silent (*khufī*) remembrance, but some of them, if necessary, also perform the vocal (*jahrī*) remembrance, just as when Khoja Aḥmad Yasawī was appointed to set out for Turkestan, he saw that the inhabitants of that place did not take to the silent remembrance; so he immediately took up the way of the vocal remembrance, and

---

2. See Muḥammad b. 'Alī as-Sanūsī, *As-salsabīl al-mu'īn fī 'ṭ-ṭarā'iq al-arba'īn* (Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī, 1968), p. 92. I am indebted to Hamid Algar for this reference, correcting my remark in Fletcher, "Central Asian Sufism," p. 81, where I doubted the existence of the Yasawiyya in the Yemen.

3. See A. A. Semenov, ed., *Sobranie vostochnykh rukopisei Akademii Nauk Uzbekskoi SSR*, Vol. 3 (Tashkent: AN UzSSR, 1955), pp. 361-362, MS No. 2686, where the Jahriyya and Yasawiyya are represented as separate (but not necessarily unconnected). I have not been able to consult the MS described.

thus the *dhikr-i arra* was created."<sup>4</sup>

That the Makhdūm-i A'ẓam himself disapproved of the vocal *dhikr* - at least as practiced by the shaykhs of the Jahriyya - may be seen in a passage from the "Jāmi' al-maqāmāt" of Abū'l-Baqā b. Khwāja Bahā' ad-Dīn b. Makhdūm-i A'ẓam (Bodleian Library, Oxford, MS 2493), vols. 67v-68r:

67v12 نقل کرد درویشی که یکبار در بدایت ملازمت بانحضرت در موضعی  
13 رسیدم که انجا یکی از مشایخ جهریه باجمعی از مریدان خود انگیز ذکر  
کرده بودند

14 مانیز بطریق رابطه که بانحضرت داشتیم متوجه شویم واحضار انحضرت  
68r1 میکردم که ناکاه ان شیخ با مریدان ازگفتن ذکر باز ایستادند وچنان شدند  
که

2 هیچکس از ایسان نتوانستند که نفسی بیرون آرند واین واقعه موافق آن  
قولست که

3 حضرت خوجه<sup>5</sup> جهان خوجه عبد الخالق غجدوانی قدس الله روحه العزیز  
فرمودند<sup>6</sup> که

4 هیچکس از طریقهای دیگر<sup>7</sup> با فند های کینه این طریقه علیه مقاومت نتوانند  
کرد

[The following] was related by<sup>8</sup> a dervish:

Once, at the beginning of [my] attendance upon the Ḥaḍrat [i.e., the Makhdūm-i A'ẓam], I came to a place where one of the shaykhs of the Jahriyya had begun the *dhikr* with a group of his disciples. We also commenced in the manner of the relationship that we held toward the

4. M. F. Köprülü, *Türk edebiyatında ilk mutasavvıflar* (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Basımevi, 1966), p. 100, n.55.

5. This spelling of خواجه is not uncommon in Central Asian sources.

6. Written فرمودند.

7. Text has دیگر از.

8. Passive only to reflect the word order of the original. Each of these accounts, which make up a substantial proportion of the MS, begins with the words *naql kard*.

Ḥaḍrat [i.e., performing a silent *dhikr*]. And I invoked the Ḥaḍrat, when suddenly that shaykh [of the Jahriyya] and [his] disciples ceased saying the *dhikr* and became so that not one of them could utter a word. And this occurrence conforms to the remark that Ḥaḍrat-i Khōja-yi Jahān Khōja Abd al-Khāliq-i Ghijduwānī<sup>9</sup> (may God bless his dear soul) made, that no one from other tarakats can withstand the smallest device (*fand*)<sup>10</sup> of this exalted tarikat [= the Naqshbandiyya].

But fols. 119v-120r of the same work contain another passage showing that for all the 'Makhdūm-i A'zam's disapproval of the Jahriyya's vocal *dhikr*, the *dhikr-i arra* lay hidden, so to speak, in silent form under that Naqshbandī's hat:

نقل کرد آن یار غار	119v13
و محرم اسرار مولانای بابای حجره دار که در زمانی که بملازمت انحضرت	14
امدم	
شرف استان بوسئ ایشان مشرف گشتم همیشه حاضر و ناظر احوال خود می	120r1
بودم که مبدا خلاف رضای انحضرت عملی از من بوجود آید و هم وقت	2
ترسان	
و لرزان می بودم که خدمت ملازمت اینچنین پادشاهی باین استعداد	3
ضعیف	
چون توانم کردن که ناگاه یاقی مبارک از سر شفقت بمن انعام فرمودند	4
و محرم	
اسرار خود گردانیدند هر باریکه آن تاقی را بر سر خود می نهادم از	5
درون آواز زکر	
اره می آمد تا یکهفته احوال بدین منوال میگذشت بعد از ان بنا بر	6
احترام انحضرت	
آن تاقی را در گوشه گذاشتم عنایت نموده گفتند که آن تاقی را از برای	7
آن ندا	
ده ایم که در خانه گذاری و بعد از انکه آن تاقی را پوشیدم در من	8

9. Died 1179/80; establisher of the Khwājagān's silent *dhikr*.

10. I am indebted to Manoutchehr Mohandessi for the proper identification of this term.

اطمينانی و آرا

9 می پدید آمد

[The following] was related by that friend of the cave<sup>11</sup> and confident of secrets, Mawlānā Bābā-yi Ḥujradār:

At the time when I came to pay my respects to the Ḥaḍrat, I had the honor of kissing his threshold. I was always ready and watchful of my conduct lest any act displeasing to the Ḥaḍrat come from me. And at the same time I was afraid and trembling about how I, with this weak aptitude, could be in attendance upon such royalty, when suddenly, from kindness, he bestowed [his] blessing *tāqī*<sup>12</sup> upon me and made [me] his confidant of secrets. Every time I put that *tāqī* upon my head, from within [the *tāqī*] came the sound of the *dhikr-i arra*. For one week the situation continued in this way. Thereafter, out of respect for the Ḥaḍrat, I put the *tāqī* away in a corner. He showed favor and said, "We have not given [you] that *tāqī* to put away at home." And after I put on that *tāqī*, peace and tranquillity appeared within me.

This latter passage from the "Jāmi' al-maqāmāt" suggests:

(1) That textual references to the *dhikr-i arra* do not necessarily reflect the presence of the Yasawiyya.

(2) That a silent *dhikr-i arra*, and possibly also a spoken one, may have been transmitted through the Khwājagān-Naqshbandī *silsila* from as far back as the time of Aḥmad Yasawī and 'Abd al-Khāliq Ghijduwānī in the twelfth century.

(3) That the Makhdūm-i A'ẓam, who was the spiritual ancestor of the Naqshbandiyya in China, might have transmitted the *dhikr-i arra*, silent or vocal, through his grandson Muḥammad Yūsuf and his great-grandson Khoja Āfāq, to the Chinese Naqshbandiyya, making them all the

11. The Prophet Muḥammad is said to have taught the silent *dhikr* to Abū Bakr while they were hiding from their enemies in a cave.

12. I.e., Arabic *ṭāqī*, the Sufi's mitre.

more susceptible later on, in the eighteenth century, to Ma Ming-hsin's New Teaching of the vocal *dhikr* of the Jahriyya.

ADDENDA ET CORRIGENDA

(TUBA I, 1977)

\*

EKLEMELER VE DÜZELTMELER

E. Birnbaum, pp. 1-64

- p. 20 para. 2 line 2: for *yemek* read *yimek*.  
p. 27 n. 35 line 4: for *ment* read *men*.  
p. 28 n. 39: مَشَايِحُونَ read مَشَايِحُونَ  
p. 39 line 5 from bottom: after *hoşnūd* add 99a 1.  
p. 41 line 6: read المَاءُ  
p. 42 last line: after *bilmeyince* add 'not knowing'.  
p. 43 line 8: after *rā* add *and zā*.  
line 10: after 'after' add جنازه *cenāze* 36b 8 'corpse, funeral'.  
p. 46 line 11: for 8a 3 read 80a 3 and add عَقِيلُ لُو *caqīl lū* 80a 5 'intelligent'.  
p. 48 line 11: after *hūlan!* add 86a 10.  
p. 52 line 1: after *sūsuzīn* add 48b 2.  
line 3 from bottom: after *buy* add *land for*.  
p. 54 line 6: for *thing* read *things*.  
p. 55 line 3: after *istemek* add 81b 3-4.  
p. 58 para (vii) line 4: after *recite* add *religious*.  
p. 60 line 19: after *çok* add يَشِيَا

J. Fletcher, pp. 113-119

- p. 113, 3rd para. first line: "the factions" should read "the two factions".  
p. 114 line 9: "erh" should read "Erh".  
p. 115 line 1: *ad-Dīn Muḥammad* should read "*ad-Dīn Naqshband (d. 1389)*. Ma was probably initiated into the Naqshbandiyya in China first, then later into the Yasawiyya in the Yemen, where the Yasawiyya had been introduced by a certain Jamāl ad-Dīn Muḥammad".  
note 2, line 1: "*al-mu<sup>c</sup>īn*" should read "*al-ma<sup>c</sup>īn*".  
p. 116 line 9: " شوم " should read " شديم ".  
line 10: " ناكاه " should read " ناكاه ".  
line 12: " ايسان " should read " ايشان ".  
line 2 from the bottom: "these accounts" should read "the accounts of this type".  
p. 117 line 5: "*Abd*" should read "*cAbd*".  
line 6: "*tarakats*" should read "*tarikats*".  
p. 118 line 3: "confident" should read "confidant".  
line 10: "blessing" should read "blessed".

P. Zieme, pp. 149-156

- p. 49 Leban: *Leben*

ADDENDA ET CORRIGENDA \* EKLEMELER VE DÜZELTMELER

- p. 150 hinzugefügte: hinzugefügte  
 p. 151 *öřu: ötrü*  
           *qamaŷ: qamaŷ*  
 p. 153 *tagmiř-läriñ: tągmiř-läriñ*  
           *körtüküm: [körtüküm]*  
 p. 154 -malov: -Malov  
 p. 156 *ol: [ol]*

Zum Thema vgl. die Abhandlung von K. B. Keping über die chinesischen Dunhuang-Texte des Suvarṇaprabhāsa-Vorwortes: Dun'chuanskij tekst predisloviya k Suvarṇaprabhāsa, in: Pis'mennye pamjatniki Vostoka 1972, Moskau 1977, 153-160.

Inzwischen ließen sich noch weitere Fragmente des Vorwortes in der Berliner Turfansammlung der AdW der DDR bestimmen. Zusammen mit den wesentlichen Varianten seien sie hier aufgeführt:

1) T III Xanthippe 512 (U 3387) = Suv. 6<sub>10</sub>-7<sub>5</sub>. Vermutlich aus sechszeiliger Pothī-Handschrift; nur einzelne Wörter erhalten; keine wesentlichen Varianten.

2) T III Xanthippe 501 (U 3382 a) = Suv. 8<sub>24</sub>-9<sub>19</sub>. Aus sechszeiliger Pothī-Handschrift; nur untere Hälfte erhalten; Variante: recto 3 [... ö]lürmiř-läriñ ymä kördüm (danach in Suv. 9<sub>3-4</sub> die Ergänzung zu ändern).

3) T III 56-72 (Original ?) = Suv. 9<sub>13</sub> ff. Vgl. Ş. Tekin, Die Kapitel über die Bewußtseinslehre im uigurischen Goldglanzsūtra (IX. und X.), Wiesbaden 1971, s. 22.

4) T III Xanthippe 501 (U 3382 b) + T III Xanthippe 514 (U 3388) = Suv. 11<sub>13</sub>-12<sub>11</sub>. Sechszeiliges Pothī-Blatt; Variante: recto 1 ökünü qatānu (= Suv. 11<sub>14</sub> qatānu).

5) T III 56-24 (U 642), vgl. Ş. Tekin, Die Kapitel über die Bewußtseinslehre, s. 22; Fragment aus 25-30 zeiliger Pothī-Handschrift. = Suv. 14<sub>3</sub>-14<sub>13</sub> und 15<sub>5</sub>-15<sub>18</sub>. Varianten und Ergänzungen:

- recto 2 [... ] ažunintaqī (Ergänzung zu Suv. 14<sub>4</sub>)  
 recto 3 [... so] rulmiř atī yolī (Ergänzung zu Suv. 14<sub>5</sub>)  
 recto 4 [tip muñila] yu bitig itdī: (Ergänzung zu Suv. 14<sub>6</sub>)  
 recto 5 [... biř yol] ärkligingā tągükdä (Ergänzung in Suv. 14<sub>7</sub> falsch)  
 recto 6 [anīng ara o]l bąg-ning (Ergänzung in Suv. 14<sub>8</sub> falsch).

6) T III 56-96 (Mainz 306) = Suv. 18<sub>16</sub>-19<sub>3</sub> und 19<sub>19</sub>-20<sub>6</sub>. Aus 25 bis 30zeiliger Pothī-Handschrift; Varianten und Ergänzungen:

- recto 5 vor křanti qılŷıl (Suv. 18<sub>20</sub>): kiřing üčün  
 recto 10-11 ergänzt Suv. 19<sub>1-3</sub> tavradi balıq bāgi savinča bo [nom] ärdinig uluy törün toqun ..  
 verso 6-11 ergänzt Suv. 20<sub>1-6</sub>:

- 6 [.....] bolup manga yaqın  
 7 [.....] yala inča tip tidi-lar  
 8 [.....] bizni yaŷı yvlaq  
 9 [törün toqu] n ölürip isig özümüz  
 10 [.....] z turdung ärsär ymä inčip  
 11 [.....] amtī säning atıng-qa

7) T III TV 49 (U 1102) = Suv. 16<sub>6</sub>-16<sub>13</sub> und 17<sub>10</sub>-17<sub>17</sub>. Linkes Fragment eines 25-30 zeiligen Pothī-Blattes; keine wesentlichen Varianten. Die erhaltene Paginierung bařtinqı [ül]üř yiti "I. Abschnitt, (Blatt) 7" bedeutet, daß in dieser Abschrift die Erzählung nicht zum Vorwort (şü) gehörte, sondern zum I. Abschnitt (juan).

Dursun Yıldırım, p. 177

- p. 177 satır 8: "Aynı yıllar içinde Rusçaya tercüme ederek bastırır." şöyle düzeltilecek: "Aynı yıllar içinde Xodzko'nun tesbit ettiği metinler İngilizceye ve Rusçaya tercüme edilip yayımlanır."