

İstanbul Üniversitesi Yayın No: 4725
ISSN 1303-5746



**İSTANBUL ÜNİVERSİTESİ
İLAHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ
DERGİSİ**

REVIEW OF THE FACULTY OF THEOLOGY OF ISTANBUL UNIVERSITY

Hakemli Dergi

SAYI: 15

YIL: 2007

İSTANBUL - 2007

**TAQIYYA (DISSIMULATION) AND ITS BEING
FUNDAMENTAL BELIEF IN SHI'A SECT
(TAKIYYE KAVRAMI VE ŞİA MEZHEBİNDE BİR İNANÇ
PRENSİBİ HALİNE GELİŞİ)**

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mehmet DALKILIÇ*

ÖZET

Bu makalenin amacı *takiyye* kelimesinin tarih içerisinde kazandığı anlamları ve çeşitli İslam mezhepleri tarafından uygulanış şekillerini tespit etmektir. Bu nedenle Şîa, Ehl-i sünnet, Havâric ve yeri geldikçe de Mutezilenin *takiyye* inançları söz konusu edilmiştir. İslam peygamberinden hemen sonra tartışma konusu haline gelen *takiyye* kavramının özellikle şîa tarafından bir inanç prensibi ve doktrin haline getirilmesi şîi kaynaklardan hareketle tahlil edilmiştir. Bu arada Ehl-i sünnetin *takiyye*ye bakı ve onun, yalanla ilişkilendirilmesi tartışılmıştır. Bu konuda en azından başlangıçta kesin olarak olumsuz bir tavır sergileyen Haricilerin konuyla ilgili tutumları da incelenmiştir. Sonuçta bu davranış şeklinin Türk dini gelenek ve göreneklerine uymadığı vurgulanmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Takiyye, Şia, Mezhep, inanç doktrini, Hariciler

ABSTRACT

**TAQIYYA (DISSIMULATION) AND ITS BEING FUNDAMENTAL BELIEF
IN SHI'A SECT**

The purpose of the article is to research the meaning of the *taqiyah* or *dissimulation* (a religious obligation to conceal one's true religious identity in the face of danger) and its practices by Islamic sects in the history. I discussed its literally meanings and practices according to the Shi'ite. I studied the believes in *taqiyah* according to the other Islamic sects like Ahlus Sunnah, Hawarij and Mu'tazilah. It is appeared that the question of *taqiyah* was discussed among the Islamic sects in the early centuries after Muhammad had died. And it was explained that it is a part of the Shi'ite theology as a doctrine and has many writings by the virtue of *taqiyah*. It is enlightened that the Sunnis' belief in Shi'ites' *taqiyah* as pure hypocrisy and a lack of faith in this article. Furthermore, Hawarij declared in which there was no *taqiyah* as a doctrine in Islamic believes. In the end, it is claimed that besides Islamic sources, Turkish religious tradition has no permission of *taqiyah* as a doctrine.

Key Words: Taqiya, Shiite, Sect, doctrine, Separators (Hawarij)

* Associate Professor of History of Islamic Sects at Istanbul University.

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of the article is to research the meaning of the taqiya or dissimulation (a religious obligation to conceal one's true religious identity in the face of danger) and its practices by Islamic sects in the history. So it is necessary to be discussed its literally meanings and practices according to the Shiite tradition. It is appeared that the question of taqiya was discussed among the Islamic sects in the early centuries after Muhammad had died. And it is accepted that the taqiya is a part of the Shiite theology as a doctrine and has many writings by the virtue of taqiya. It is enlightened that the Sunnis' belief in Shiites' taqiya as pure hypocrisy and a lack of faith in this article. Furthermore, taqiya was discussed by the sub-sects of Hawarij (the withdrawers) and most of them declared that there was no taqiya as a doctrine in Islamic believes. In the end, it is claimed that besides Islamic sources, religious tradition has no permission of taqiya as a doctrine.

In that frame, it is intended to demonstrate that if the concept of 'al-taqiya' is an integral part of Islam or not, and that if it is a Shiite concoction or not. According to the purposes of Qur'anic verses, how can it be explained the Shiites belief in dissimulation (taqiya)? How can they be commented the verses mentioned in the Holy Qur'an in three places: "Let not the believers take the disbelievers as guardians instead of the believers, and whoever does that will never be helped by Allah in any way, unless you indeed fear a danger from them (illa an tattaqu minhum tuqat)." (Qur'an 3:28) and "Whoever disbelieved in Allah after his belief - except him who is forced thereto and whose heart is at rest with faith."(Qur'an 16:106) or "And a believing man of Pharaoh's family who hid his faith...."(Qur'an 40:28). Do these three verses clearly point to the permissibility of concealing one's ideology and opinion whenever in danger? Many customs and traditions that are prevalent amongst the followers of various Islamic sects today are not based on the fundamental principals of the Islamic belief. Rather they have gradually been instilled in the sub-culture during centuries. Taqiya (dissimulation) of one's true belief has been a common practice amongst the followers of Shi'a.

Taqiya (dissimulation), as a concept, has become the subject of numerous debates from the first day it was used in the history of Islamic Sects. Some people who accept taqiya as a belief principle has voiced their views on the boundaries and conditions of taqiya. However, some people who reject taqiya have voiced their views on sociological, psychological and moral effects of such behaviour.¹ On this regard, it can be said easily that this concept of taqiya is one of the distinctive concepts among others for the history of Islamic Sects.

It is known that taqiya has a considerable importance in Shi'ite Sect of Islam. In the Islamic Sects and Islamic theology sources, it draws attention that Ahl al-Sunnah scholars did not discuss the taqiya in their books for the reason of their not viewing it as a belief matter. Ahl al-Sunnah scholars were become contended by mentioning taqiya issue in interpretation of verses related to taqiya and compelling (ikrah) section of their jurisprudence books and expounding taqiya's provisions and decrees.² For the reason of Ahl al-Sunnah scholars' not being under oppression and terror as a society, they took the taqiya issue in a narrow form and distinct, limited way, and described it in a similar way.

It is possible to observe that this problem, which has a historical background, actually keeps its liveliness in our time. In the end, people in their daily life, for whatever reason, may prefer to put forth their belief, thought, ideology via taqiya. If somebody is thought to be practicing taqiya or a person

¹ For detail see Shayh Saduq, *Risâlah al-Itikâdat al-Imâmiyyah*, trs. Ethem Ruhi Figlali, Ankara 1978, p. 127 and passim; Mirza Husain, *Mustadrak al-vasâil*, Tahran 1382, vol. II, pp. 240-247; Tabâtabâî, *al-Mîzân fî tafsîr al-Qur'ân*, Tahran 1985, vol. III, pp. 161-162; Idem., *Shi'ite Islam*, trs. Sayyid Husain Nasr, New York 1975, p. 223 and passim; Majlisi, *Bihâr al-anvâr*, Bairut 1986, vol. LXXII, p. 393; Muhammad Riza al-Muzaffar, *Akâid al-Imâmiyya*, Tahran no dated, p. 76; Maqârîm Shirâzî, *Taqiya Sipar-i Barây-i Mucadalahâ-i Amiktar*, trs. Hasan Uzuncam, Istanbul 1992, pp. 8, 16-23; Golpinarli, *Şiilik*, Istanbul 1987, p. 564. Also see Sarahsî, *al-Mabsût*, Bairut Dâr al-Ihya, no dated, vol. XXXIV, pp. 45-49; al-Jassas, *al-Ahkâm al-Qur'ân*, Bairut 1335, vol. II, p. 9; Qurtubî, *al-Jami li Ahkâm al-Qur'ân*, Cairo 1967, vol. IV, p. 57; Cemil Hakyemez, "Şii Takiyye İnancının Teşekkülü", *Çorum İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, sayı: 6, yıl 2004/2, s. 129-146.

² İrfan Abdulhamid, *Dirâsât fî aI-firâk wa al-'akâid al-Islâmiyya*, Bagdat 1977, p. 55.

admits that he is practicing taqiya, the aim is clear here: in the most general sense, it is known that the person for whatever reason, he hides his real thought or belief.³ In another word he has got some hidden 'secrets'.

Certainly, such behaviour makes it necessary to think about the ethic side of the taqiya issue. If a person for whatever reason hides his thought or belief and utters it falsely, in this way does not he commit the guilt of 'lie' which all religions assert as the greatest sin? Is it possible to make a distinction between practicing taqiya and lying to in what scope and under which conditions? Alternatively, is it not possible?

In this point, to attain a sound approach, it seems inevitable to examine the taqiya issue in the frame of social conditions dominating in the first Islamic Sects period, when taqiya concept was first introduced. In this way, we will be able to determine in which frame taqiya came into existence and developed as a fact in the history of Islamic Sects.

Since the feeling 'fear' is at the core of taqiya,⁴ it seemed to be related with hiding belief just from the beginning.⁵ Especially, Muslims who are living in minority and in some situations almost living alone in the regions where they are mingling with people who have completely different beliefs, how would these Muslims' relations with those people be? That the Muslims living according to their beliefs and fulfill the requirements of their beliefs may caused sometimes the most tragic events. In this context, the first Muslims' living in Mecca is an interesting example. The Muslims, in a society living a pagan life, lived their Islamic belief that is based on unity under dangers aiming at their

³ Musa al-Musawî, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imâma inda Shîa al-Imâma", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, (International Symposium for Shiism in history and Contemporary), pp. 738-749.

⁴ See Ibn Manzur, *Lisan al-Arab*, "vky"; Zabidi, *Taj al-arus*, "vky"; Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. VIII, p. 12.

⁵ For related verses with taqiya in Qur'an see Al-i Imran 3/28. Also see Nuh 71/9; Hud 11/38; al-Saffat 37/88-89; al-Anbiya 21/60; al-Qasas 28/15.

lives and goods. In this struggle, many people lost their lives and underwent the worst cases of torture.⁶

Against this oppression, Islamic prophet gave permission to Muslims to migrate other cities where they can live their beliefs more comfortably and freely than Mecca. In this way, migration formed a basis for Muslims to flee from oppression and find places where they can practice their beliefs without difficulty. However, migration is not always possible and not a valid method. Throughout history, many Muslims, for various reasons, are compelled to live in societies where their belief is not dominant.

Besides, it should not be disregarded since taqiya being a concept closely associated with inters human relations, it sometimes made itself known in arrangement and development of human relations. Actually, in some sources attention was paid to the points taqiya differs from discord (nifaq) and lie. The reason for this attention is the prediction that the taqiya belief may cause mass problems.⁷ It is a fact that the taqiya issue has other psychological, sociological, and political aspects in addition to its historical aspect.⁸ It is thought provoking that especially today taqiya is often used in political speeches and this shows that taqiya still maintains its importance. Again, attention was paid that some Muslim groups arrange their relations with other Muslim groups based on taqiya and this can have a negative effect on the youth.⁹ However, in Shi'ite, the

⁶ See Shayh Saduk, *al-I'tikadat*, p. 127 etc.; al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 219; al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. XX, p. 123; Tabatabai, *Shi'ite Islam*, trs. Sayyid Husain Nasr, New York, 1975, p. 223; Idem., *al-Mizan fi tafsir al-Qur'an*, Tahran, 1985, vol. XII, p. 357; Majlisi, *Bihar al-anvar*, vol. LXII, p. 393 etc.

⁷ For example see Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 35-37. Cf., Ihsan Ilahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 140-142; Mustafa Öz, *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Ca'fer es-Sadık", vol. II, p. 2; Musa al-Musavi, "al-Taqiyya", pp. 743-749.

⁸ Mehmet Saffet Sarıkaya, *İslam Düşünce Tarihinde Mezhepler*, Isparta 2001, p. 32; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-91.

⁹ Mehmet Saffet Sarıkaya, *İslam Düşünce Tarihinde Mezhepler*, p. 32.

withdrawers (Hawarij) and Ahl al-Sunna Sects, concept of taqiya in the respect to belief is examined by using historical events.

II. DESCRIPTION OF TAQIYA CONCEPT

Linguists and theologians have expressed their opinion about the meaning and etymology of the word taqiya.¹⁰ In Arabic, it comes from the root “viqaya” meaning “to protect” or from the root “ittaqa” meaning, “to get fear or to protect oneself”. Literally meaning of taqiya is “to protect oneself” and “to avoid or to guard oneself against”. Therefore, “Ittakaytu” means in Arabic, “I avoided, and I guarded myself against” or “I protected myself”. Although, this word is not used as the form of “taqiya” in the Qur’an, in Al-i Imran sura of the Qur’an the verse “unless that ye but guard yourselves against them”.¹¹ The word “tuqah” comes from the same root “tuqah” (تقية) sometimes is read and written as the form of “taqiya”. As noted in the sources, most of the reciting Muslim scholars (imams) read or pronounced this word as “tuqah”, and some as “taqiya”. However, both for being correct in grammatical sense and for the soundness of narration, reading this word as “tuqah” is preferred and common in Arabic Language.¹²

¹⁰ For detail about the root of taqiya see Ibn Manzur, *Lisan al-'Arab*, "vky"; al-Zabidi, *Tac al-'arus*, "vky"; al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, Bairut, no dated, vol. VIII, p. 12.

¹¹ Al-i Imran 3/28.

¹² Ibn Manzur, *Lisan al-'Arab*, "vky"; al-Zabidi, *Taj al-'arus*, "vky"; Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. VIII, p. 12; Ibn Hayyan, *al-Bahr al-Muhit*, edit. Abdullah-Muhammad al-Salih al-Rashid, Riyad no dated, vol. II, p. 424; Tabari, *Jami al-bayan fi tafsir al-Qur'an*, Egypt 1314, vol. III, p. 141; Suyuti, *al-Durr al-mansur fi al-tafsir bi al-ma'sur*, vol. II, p. 16; Mustafa Kamil al-Shaybi, “al-Taqiya Usulüha wa Tatavvuruha”, *Majallat Kulliyat al-Adab-Jamia'a al-Iskandariyya* 1963, vol. 16, p. 233; Also for various version of ittaqa see: Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mefatih al-gayb*, vol. VIII, p. 16; Ibn al-Jazari, *Sharh al-Samannudi 'ala manti al-durrat al-mutimmat li al-qiraat al-'ashara*, Egypt no dated, p. 36; idem., *al-Nashr fi al-qiraat al-'ashr*, Bairut no dated, vol. II, p. 239; Zamahshri, *al-Kashshaf 'an hakaik al-tanzil wa 'uyun al-akavil fi vucuh al-ta'vil*, Cairo no dated, vol. I, p. 129; Jazari, *Tahbirat al-taysir fi qiraat al-aimnat al-'aşara*, Halab 1392, p. 96.

The word 'al-taqiya' literally means: "Concealing or disguising one's beliefs, convictions, ideas, feelings, opinions, and/or strategies at a time of eminent danger, whether now or later in time, to save oneself from physical and/or mental injury." A one-word translation would be 'dissimulation'. In another word, "The Shiite belief concerning taqiya the Shi'ah believe in a doctrine called taqiya which means that a person holds a specific belief in his heart but his speech is contrary to his inner beliefs and it is through this that they deceive the Ahl al-Sunnah.

On the other hand, it is noted that the word "taqiya" has a close relation to the word "taqwa". According to this view, fear and avoidance forms the foundation for taqwa and taqiya. Therefore, taqwa is to obey to an omnipotent power, Allah's power and to protect himself from all prohibitions of Allah for fear of Allah's punishment. As to taqiya, it is to accept the superiority of a particular power and to protect one's body from the harm, which may come from this particular power. Therefore, taqiya is to protect oneself like taqwa, but taqwa does not include taqiya. Anyhow, it is accepted that coming from the same root, these words coalesce with each other on the profundity of their meaning.¹³

We should immediately note here that there is not a description of the word "taqiya" accepted unanimously by Islamic sects (madhabs). People have evaluated this concept according to the political environment and social structure of their age since hijri I. century.¹⁴ Therefore, many people accepted taqiya as a permission that can be used by a person who is under torture to save his life and to escape torture.¹⁵ However, whatever the purpose is, in Islamic

¹³ For example see Ragıb al-Isfahani, *al-Mufradat fi garib al-Qur'an*, edit. Muhammad Sayyid Kilani, Bairut no dated, "vky"; Kamil al-Shaybi, "al-Taqiyya", pp. 234-235; Ali Ünal, *Kur'an'da Temel Kavramlar*, İstanbul 1986, p. 517; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 9.

¹⁴ See Irfan Abdulhamid, *Dirasat*, pp. 59-60; Murtaza al-Ansari, *al-Taqiyya*, Bairut 1410, pp. 45-50.

¹⁵ Sarahsi, *Mabsut*, vol. XXIV, p. 47; Qurtubi, *al-Jami li ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. IV, p. 57; Murtaza al-Ansari, *al-Taqiyya*, p. 45; Alusi, *Ruh al-ma'ani*, Bairut, no dated, vol. III, p. 121;

madhabs when a Muslim is in fear of pressure, menace and torture taqiya came into agenda.

In Ahl al-Sunna sources, taqiya mentioned as a concept meaning caution, fear and hide oneself by the way of making concession from religion when one comes under harm or coercion.¹⁶ In view of this fact, Sarahsi (d. 483/1090) states that a believer's pretence and false behaviour to save his life and avoid torture is called taqiya.¹⁷

So, when a person is in a condition in which he has fear, it is possible to give him permission for saving his life a protection in tuqah style. However, it should be done by language. Ibn Abbas stated that in the case, this protection cannot be done using action and this permission is given only when protection is done orally.¹⁸ For this reason, a believer, using taqiya umbrella, is not permitted to help enemy.

On the other side, Shaikh al-Mufid (d. 412/1021), one of the leading scholars of Shi'a described taqiya as "hide the truth, conceal belief, hide oneself from dissidents, not to explain things which will cause harm in worldly and religious affairs," for the reasons addressed above.¹⁹ Tabatabai (d. 1401/1981) who explains taqiya in general meaning as protection from all kind of danger or avoidance, describes taqiya as "a person's hiding or concealing his religion or

Elmalılı, *Hak Dini Kur'an Dili*, Nebioğlu basımevi 1960, vol. II, p. 1074; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyyah al-siyasiyyah al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-90; Kerimoğlu, *Kelimeler Kavramlar*, İstanbul 1992, p. 134. Cf., Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 8, 16-23.

¹⁶ Cf., Muhammad b. Ebu Bakir al-Razi, *Muhtar al-sihah*, "vky", vol. I, p. 305; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyyah al-siyasiyyah al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-90.

¹⁷ Sarahsi, *al-Mabsut*, vol. XXXIV, pp. 45-49.

¹⁸ Tabari, *Jami al-bayan*, vol. III, p. 140; Ibn Hayyan, *Bahr al-muhit*, Riyad no dated, vol. II, p. 423; Suyuti, *al-Durr al-mansur fi al-tafsir bi al-ma'sur*, vol. II, p. 16.

¹⁹ Shayh Mufid, *Tashih al-i'tikad*, pp. 219-222; Also see *Nahc al-balaga*, trs. Abdalbaki Gölpinarlı, p. 286; Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 9.

some of his religious behaviors under the conditions in which an absolute threat is possible by his enemies."²⁰

Jafar al-Sadiq (d. 148/765) is quoted "taqiya is valid for everything except making ablution on leather light thin-soled boot (shoes)".²¹ However, it is stated that taqiya is not permissible when it can result in situations leading to enmity in religion and bloodshed. It was narrated that taqiya is permissible to prevent bloodshed, but when it comes to bloodshed taqiya is not permissible.²² Doctrinal responses to oppression are found not only in purely *taqiya* (dissimulation), but also in other Shii doctrines such as Mahdist doctrines. According to Jafri taqiya, instituted by Muhammad al-Baqir and elaborated by Jafar al-Sadiq,²³ has a "double meaning of caution and dissimulation for survival in a hostile world"²⁴ that is, believers may deny their beliefs if those beliefs put their lives in danger.

Shia claims that taqiyyah is a Quranic belief and sahabah have accepted it. So their assertion is that the taqiyyah is not concocted by Shi'a later. To Shi'a sect, Prophet Muhammad and the Ahl al-Bayt (Family of Muhammad) practice of this belief in their life as well. They write many virtues of taqiya so that they can practice taqiya to the utmost. They claim that there are many references concerning taqiya are established strictly from Shiite literature. For example it is quoted from Jafar al-Sadiq on the necessity of taqiya: "Taqiya is my religion and the religion of my forefathers. Anyone who does not practice taqiya has no religion."²⁵

²⁰ Muhammad Husain Tabatabai, *Shi'ite Islam*, (trs., S. Hossein Nasr), p. 223.

²¹ al-Kulayni, *al-Usul min al-Kafi*, (edit. Ali Akbar al-Gaffari), Tehran 1388, vol. II, p. 217; Kâmil eş-Şeybî, "et-Takiyyetti", s. 242; Hasan el-Mûsevî, *Kavâid*, V, 47.

²² al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 217-220.

²³ S.H.M Jafri, *The Origins and Early Development of Shi'a Islam*, London, 1979, p. 298.

²⁴ John Esposito, *Islam: The Straight Path*, New York, 1998, p. 48.

²⁵ al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p., 219; Sayyid Mirza Hasan, *al-Kavâid al-fiqhiyya*, V, 45.

Though the origins of taqiya can be traced back to the early Shiite communities, some Iranian sources allege its wide spread practice amongst the first generation of Iranian Zoroastrians following the introduction of Islamic rule. However, most sources agree that taqiya, in one form or another has been a feature of religious life in Iran during the centuries.

Taqiya thus became an important tool for the promulgation of the Shiite thought on the one hand, and the concealment of their hidden 'secrets' on the other. Shiite members used this dual approach during his travels in Iran whilst promoting his vision.

According to Imamiyah or Twelver sect, taqiya which involves hiding belief; hiding Shi'a, pretend to be a Sunni in Sunni environments can be done when life and property is in danger. Taqiya is used as a policy and political maneuvering instrument. Whereas, for a Hawarij (the withdrawers)' taqiya is completely different. Hawarij named taqiya as accepting living under rule of a caliph who is not from their people or to be silent and not revolt against the caliphs who are not from their people.²⁶

After all these taqiya consideration and its application ways in madhabs and determining the changes occurred to taqiya throughout the history and to make comparisons in the application of taqiya in the first years of Islam, it is inevitable to explain the interpretation of verses related to issue and events, conditions in Asr al-Saadah.

II. Theological Context of Discussions on Taqiya

The thought of taqiya is primarily based on the sentence "but your guarding yourself against unbelievers is excepted" in the verse in the Qur'an meaning "Believers take not unbelievers as friends instead of believers; who behaves like this He has no value by Allah, but your guarding yourself against

²⁶ Shahrastani, *Milal wa al-nihal*, vol. I, p. 125; R. Strothmann, *Islam Ansiklopedisi*, "Takiya"; Rashid Riza, *al-Manar*, vol. III, pp. 280-281; Abdulaziz al-Dihlavi, *Muhtasar al-tuhfa al-isna-'aş, shariyya*, p. 289.

unbelievers is excepted. Allah guards you with himself. Return is to Allah."²⁷ So, when this conditions is explained it is emphasized that if a person fears that unbelievers due to his faith in Allah would destroy his life²⁸ or some of his organs and have a feeling under his conscience that his behavior is not right and he does not believe in it. It was evaluated differently to talk with unbelievers in a way to save his life.²⁹

First of all, if we touch on the evaluations of Ahl al-Sunna on taqiya mater, just as in the other madhabs Ahl al-Sunna is seen mentioning the same verse.³⁰ Maturidi (d. 333/944) stated that in addition to this verse,³¹ in the verse "You can not see people who believed in Allah and his Messenger to befriend with people who opposed Allah and his Messenger."³² And the verse "O believers, do not befriend my enemy and your enemy",³³ Allah banned Muslims from befriending unbelievers and have a close relations with them. However, Maturidi explained using the verse meaning "...But your guarding yourself against unbelievers is excepted..." That believers living under the rule of unbelievers and due to kinship while knowing their belief is not true path, permission was granted to this believers to establish kinship and friendship with

²⁷ Al-i Imran 3/28. Also see al-Nahl 16/106; al-Mu'min 40/28.

²⁸ For example see Tabari, *Jami al-bayan*, vol. III, pp. 140-41; vol. XIII, pp. 112-13; Shayh Saduk, *Risalah al-I'tikadat al-Imamiyya*, trs. Atham Ruhi Figlali, Ankara 1987, p. 127 and passim; Jassas, *Ahkam al-Qur'an*, Istanbul 1335, vol. II, p. 9; Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. III, p. 10 and passim; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. X, p. 121; Tabatabai, *al-Mizan fi tafsir al-Qur'an*, Tahran 1985, vol. III, p. 161; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 26-29; Ahmad Tayibi Shabastari, *Taqiyya*, Tahran 1362, p. 8.

²⁹ See Maturidi, *Ta'wilat al-Qur'an*, Library of Haci Salim Aga., no. 40, vol. I, fol. 76^b; al-Maclisi, *Bihar al-anvar al-Jamia li durar ahbar al-aimma al-athar*, Bairut 1986, vol. LXXII, p. 393; Muhammad Riza al-Muzaffar, *'Akaid al-Imamiyya*, trs. Abdulbakty Golpinarli, Istanbul 1978, p. 76; Tabatabai, *Shi'ite Islam*, p. 223; Ali al-Musavi, *Shubihat havla al-Shia*, Bairut, no dated, p. 12; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. I, p. 122.

³⁰ See Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir al-Qur'an al-Azim*, Istanbul, vol. II, pp. 23-24; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, p. 121; Muhammad Rashid Riza, *Manar*, Bairut no dated, vol. III, p. 280.

³¹ Al-i Imran 3/118.

³² al-Mumtahina 60/1; Aslo sec al-Mucadala 58/22; al-Maida 5/51; al-Tavba 9/71.

³³ Al-i Imran 3/28.

unbelievers. Maturidi gives as evidence the incidence when his father died, Ali b. Abi Talib came to the Allah's Messenger Muhammad and said, "your uncle died in misguidance". In response, Allah's Messenger told him to go and bury his father. Apart from these conditions, it is understood that in Islam taqiya is not permitted.³⁴ The event that justifies this view is Ammar b. Yasir incidence.

As a matter of fact this is clearly explained in the following verse "Any one who, after accepting faith in Allah, utters Unbelief -except under compulsion, his heart remaining firm in Faith- but such as open their breast to Unbelief, on them is Wrath from Allah, and theirs will be a dreadful Chastisement"³⁵. This verse, in order to save the life, seems to allow saying some sayings words enable make him to be unbelievers under the death treat on the condition of that his heart firmly remains in Faith³⁶. Both Sunni and Shi'ite sources indicate that the verse revealed on the torture was deemed for Ammar b. Yasir by pagan Arabs.³⁷

Taking the subject in his Tafsir, Zamahshari (d. 538/1144) questions whether to say against faith by using the facilitation of taqiya (dissimulation) as Ammar did or to stay in the line of believing by being patient and to be rewarded as his parents did is the better action. He indicates his opinion in favour of the behavior acted by³⁸.

Likewise, most of Hanafite jurists declare the same legislations and opinions. They state that not giving up his faith, a believer keeps on his accepting and believing even until to be killed for the sake of religion is the

³⁴ For example see Maturidi, *Ta'vilat al-Qur'an*, vol. I, fol. 76^b; Also see Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir*, vol. II, p. 24; Jassas, *Ahkam*, vol. II, p. 9.

³⁵ al-Nahl 16/106.

³⁶ Tabari, *Jami al-bayan*, vol. XIV, p. 113; Tabatabai, *al-Mizan fi tafsir al-Qur'an*, vol. XII, p. 357; Sarahsi, *Mabsut*, vol. XXIII, p. 44; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 8, 26-29; Ahmad Tayibi Shabastari, *Taqiyya*, p. 8.

³⁷ Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. XX, p. 123; Tabatabai, *Shi'ite Islam*, p. 223; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 28-30.

³⁸ Zamahshari, *Kashaf*, vol. I, p. 300.

better than to act with dissimulation³⁹. However, in terms of death treatment, it should be in mind that the human beings naturally try to save his life. The attitude of Ahl al-Sunna regarding this issue will be elaborated.

III. The Historical Context of Debate and Attitude of Islamic Sects

1. Taqiya in Hawarij (the Withdrawers)

a. In Hawarij

The strongest dissidents of taqiya are Hawarij who represents radical and fanatic belief group in Islamic world. Just the opposite of Shi'a, they voiced their beliefs and thoughts without any restrain. For this reason, they opposed application of taqiya fiercely.⁴⁰ However, it is not possible to evaluate all the Hawarij groups in the same view. Because the taqiya perception of almost all Hawarij groups like Azariqa, Najadat, Sufriya, and Ibadiya appeared in the direction of their political views and the conditions of their period.⁴¹

We have to state that these two features are very important in the development of taqiya concept. The first of these two features is Shi'a and Hawarij, which based them on the political reason at first, gave a creed dimension to their views by basing on their political views with Qur'an and sunnah (religious actions that were instituted by the Prophet Muhammad).⁴² By

³⁹ Sarahsi, *Mabsut*, vol. XXIII, pp. 44-45; Jassas, *Ahkam*, vol. II, p. 10; Abu Hayyan, *Bahr al-muhit*, vol. II, p. 424; Bagavi, *Ma'alim al-tanzil*, Bairut 1407/1987, vol. I, p. 292.

⁴⁰ Shahristani, *Milal*, vol. I, p. 192; Julius Wellhausen, *İslamiyetin İlk Devirlerinde Dini-Siyasi Muhalefet Partileri*, trs. Fikret İştihan, Ankara 1996, p. 44; Ignaz Goldziher, *al-Akida wa al-sharia fi al-Islam*, p. 180; Avni İlhan, "Takiyye", pp. 159-160.

⁴¹ Watt, *The formative period of Islamic thought*, p. 29 and passim; Julius Wellhausen, *The religio-political factions in early Islam*, pp. 25-29 and passim; Avni İlhan, "Taqiyya", p. 159 and passim.

⁴² Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 88-91; Musa al-Musavi, "al-Taqiyya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-749; Julius Wellhausen, *The religio-political factions in early Islam*, pp. 22 and passim.

this way, taqiya played an important role in their continuation of existence. The second of these two features is, taqiya's becoming a religious doctrine in Shi'a in connection with the perception mentioned above.

Hawarij groups, just like in the other Islamic madhabs, tended to support their ideas by the verses of Qur'an. As a matter of fact, Azariqa advocated the necessity of opposing openly to the caliphs who didn't carry characteristic features Azariqa demanded. They were trying to explain this situation to their people by explaining the wrongness of practicing taqiya. In fact, by putting forward the verses in the Qur'an meaning, "did not you see them whom we ordained not to fight, perform prayer, and give obligatory alms? When we ordain them to fight, some of them fear from people just as they fear from Allah, even more profoundly..."⁴³ and the verse meaning, "Allah brings a nation who fights in the way of Allah and they do not fear derision of the derider."⁴⁴ They were explaining that it was not permissible to act practicing taqiyah.⁴⁵

As to Najadat, to the contrary of Azariqa they consider that it would be more useful to use taqiya in protecting their existence rather than opposing and fighting with the caliph openly. For this reason, they too preferred the way of proving correctness of their views with Qur'anic verses. As a result of this, they opposed Azariqa by using the verses meaning, "Believers take not unbelievers as friends instead of believers; who behaves like this He has no value by Allah, but your guarding yourself against unbelievers is excepted..."⁴⁶ and "a man who concealed his belief from the pharaoh family said, would you kill a man who

⁴³ al-Nisa 4/77.

⁴⁴ al-Maida 5/54.

⁴⁵ Shahrstani, *Milal*, vol. I, p. 125; Izmirli Ismail Hakki, *Muhassal al-kalam wa al-hikma*, p. 98; Irfan Abdulhamid, *Dirasat*, p. 57; Navin Abdulhalik Mustafa, *al-Mu'arada fi al-fikr al-Siyasi al-Islami*, trs. Vacdi Akyuz, Istanbul, 1990, p. 204; Watt, *The formative period of Islamic thought*, pp. 25-27 and passim; Kamil al-Shaybi, "al-Taqiyya", pp. 239-240.

⁴⁶ Shahrstani, *Milal*, vol. I, p. 125; Kamil al-Shaybi, "al-Taqiyya", p. 239; Irfan Abdulhamid, *Dirasat*, p. 56; Watt, *The formative period of Islamic thought*, pp., 29, 35-39 and passim.

⁴⁷ Al-i Imran 3/28.

says my lord is Allah?"⁴⁸ The fact that Ibadiya also supported this view is stated in the sources.⁴⁹

Therefore, it is prevalently known that they did not permit making taqiya individually or as a society, and they advocated that however much a Muslim is forced; even if he has a fear of being killed he can not make taqiya.⁵⁰ Anyhow, their rebelling against their rulers and their dissidents throughout the history indicates this plainly.⁵¹

However, it is seen that the Hawarij's strict attitude softened throughout the history. Thus, Hawarij groups gathered under the leadership of Abdullah b. Vahb al-Rasibi were defeated and many of them killed in the war against Ali b. Abi Talib. After the attack which resulted in a few survivors, Hawarij forced to take some protection measures and the most important of these measures is formed the taqiya policy which means to hide one's religious beliefs and avoid the society in which one lives.⁵²

It is noted that to safeguard oneself against an inevitable danger is reminded as a logical rule used by most people in the various stages of life and almost all the people resorted to taqiya by way of hiding their real beliefs when

⁴⁸ Gafir 40/28.

⁴⁹ Shahrستاني, *Milal*, vol. I, p. 125; Fiğlali, "Hiriciliğın Doğışu ve Fırkalara Ayrılışı", pp. 67-74; *Ibid.*, *Ibadiye'nin Doğışu ve Görüşleri*, pp. 82-125; Navin A. Mustafa, *al-Mu'arada*, pp. 206-207; T. Lewicki, *MEB İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Ibadiye"; R. B. Serjeant, "The Ibadis", *Religion in the Middle East*, vol. III, p. 307; Watt, *The formative period of Islamic thought*, pp. 24-25, 35-36; Sabir Abdurrahman Ta'ima, *al-Ibadiyya akidatan wa madhaban*, p. 54; R. Strothmann, *MEB İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Takiya".

⁵⁰ Rashid Riza, *Manar*, vol. III, pp. 280-281; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, p. 123.

⁵¹ Navin Abdulhalik Mustafa, *al-Mu'arada*, pp. 203-204; Julius Wellhausen, *İslamiyetin İlk Devirlerinde Dini-Siyasi Muhalefet Partileri*, pp. 1-87; İrfan Abdulhamid, *Dirasat*, p. 56; R. Strothmann, *MEB İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Takiya".

⁵² Shahrستاني, *Milal*, vol. I, pp. 114-116; Julius Wellhausen, *The religio-political factions in early Islam*, pp. 24-29, 43-46; İrfan Abdulhamid, *Dirasat*, p. 81-86; Fiğlali, "Hiriciliğın Doğışu ve Fırkalara Ayrılışı", *AÜİFD*, vol. XXII, pp. 245-275; Navin Abdulhalik Mustafa, *al-Mu'arada*, p. 197; Watt, *İslam Düşüncesinin Teşekkül Devri*, trs. E. Ruhi Fiğlali, Ankara, 1981, pp. 23-36.

faced with the destruction of society's existence. As a justification for this, they indicated the counsel "Allah provided for the Muslims easiness in their actions via taqiya; so hide yourself."⁵³ Nevertheless, taqiya which is accepted as a kind of defense policy and political conditions having a profound effect on it, caused lengthy discussions among Hawarij groups whether it should be accepted or not.⁵⁴

Therefore taqiya perception in Hawarij should never be seen the same as in the Shi'a. However, it takes attention that on one side Hawarij rejected taqiya on the point of deeds; on the other side, they put forward some difficult conditions on taqiya.⁵⁵ After all this, generally it can be said that Hawarij preferred to practice taqiya as a political instrument due to some special conditions in which they live. This kind of taqiya interpretation is completely different from the protection mentioned as *tuqah* in Qur'an in both form and objectives.

At the same time, Sunni Islam developed behavior norms to balance Hawarij's hard and rude attitude. So, it is accepted as a harmonious and stable form of behavior between the hypocritical appearance of hiding belief with having a part in the society in a different identity and roughness of putting forth thought and belief without taking into consideration time and conditions.

2. Taqiya Application in Shi'a and Going away from "Tuqah" Style

The group formed by Shi'a in Islamic Society, throughout their life stages all along the history, considered taqiya as an obligation or binding duty for Muslims to protect themselves against probable dangers coming from outside or

⁵³ R. Strotmann, *MEB İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Takiya"; Tabatabai, *Shi'ite Islam*, p. 225; Avni İlhan, "Takiyya", pp. 159-160.

⁵⁴ Shahrastani, *Milal*, vol. I, pp. 124-125; Bağdadi, *al-Fark bayn al-firak*, Egypt 1948, p. 64; Kamil al-Shaybi, "al-Takiyya", pp. 238-240.

⁵⁵ Rashid Riza, *Manar*, vol. X, p. 97; *Fığlali, İbadiyye'nin Doğuşu ve Görüşleri*, AÜİF, Ankara, 1983, p. 125; Abdulaziz al-Dihlawi, *Muhtasar al-tuhfa al-isna-'ashariyya*, Istanbul, 1988, p. 289.

in an imminent danger.⁵⁶ This group always pointed out reasons like staying in opposition throughout history, to be oppressed continuously, to be deprived of safety of life, property and belief as justification for their taqiya.⁵⁷

Due to their protecting their lives, property and beliefs via pretending to accept the rule of states they lived throughout ages, in time they practiced taqiya issue a belief matter by grounding on rumours they claimed to belong to Ahl al-Bayt.⁵⁸ Actually, it shouldn't evade attention that taqiya's becoming a belief in almost all Shi'a groups is related to Imamah. Some Shi'ite members, by reminding that the first caliph should be Ali b. Abi Talib stated that the necessity of explaining the events which occurred dissident actions after decease of Prophet Muhammad. Therefore, Ali's not raising objection against the rulers before him and staying silent can only be explained by taqiya belief.⁵⁹

⁵⁶ Shayh Saduk, *Risalah al-i'tikadat al-Imamiyya*, p. 127; Al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 217 and passim; Ignaz Goldziher, *al-Akida wa al-shari'a fi al-Islam*, trs. Muhammad Yusuf - Ali Abdulkadir, p. 202; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 13-17; Ahmad al-Katib, "al-Fikr al-siyasi al-shii min al-taqiyya vwa al-intizar ila al-walayyat al-mutlaka", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, İstanbul 1993, pp. 750-759.

⁵⁷ Ibn Ebi al-Hadid, *Sharh Nahc al-balağa*, Egypt 1961, vol. XI, pp. 43-44; Mas'udi, *Muruc al-Zahab*, Egypt 1346, vol. II, p. 67; Abbas Ali al-Musavi, *Shubuhât havla al-Shia*, pp. 14-17; Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 9-10; Kashif al-Gita, *Asl al-Shia*, Bairut no dated p. 152; Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, trs. Mahmat Dag-Mahmat Aydin, İstanbul no dated, pp. 239-243; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 25 and passim; Musa al-Musavi, "al-Taqiyya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, İstanbul 1993, pp. 738-749.

⁵⁸ Goldziher, *al-Akida wa al-Shari'a fi al-Islam*, p. 202; Ahmad Amin, *Duha al-Islam*, Bairut 1351, vol. III, p. 246; Ibn Kathir, *Hadislerle Kur'an-ı Kerim Tefsiri*, trs. Hacı Bakir Karliga, et al, İstanbul no dated, vol. III, p. 1211; Hitti, *Islam Tarihi*, trs. Salih Tug, İstanbul 1980-81, vol. II, p. 678; Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 239-244; Ahmad Tayibi Shabastari, *Taqiyya*, pp. 8-10.

⁵⁹ Ibn Haldun, *Mukaddima*, trs. Zakir Kadiri Ugan, İstanbul 1988, p. 496 and passim.; İrfan Abdulhamid, *Nazariyya walaya al-fakih*, p. 13; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, p. 90; Ihsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Taqiyye Anlayışı*, trs. Sabri Hizmetli-Hasan Onat, Ankara 1984, pp. 173-176.

One of the leading scholars of this conviction Shaikh Mufid (d. 412/1021), due to above mentioned justifications explained taqiya as “hide the truth, conceal the belief, hide from opponents, not to reveal something which will bring harm on religious and worldly affairs” or in another way of expression; to safeguard oneself via hiding belief from the harms which can come from religious and worldly hostiles.⁶⁰ According to this view, two important feature of taqiya attracts attention. One of them is “hiding belief”, and another is preventing “material and spiritual damages”. Tabatabai who stated that taqiya in general sense is to avoid and safeguard from all dangers. He claimed at the same time that taqiya is a person’s hiding his belief or some religious behaviours due to enemy’s hostile actions in the cases when an absolute and probable danger is imminent.⁶¹

From these descriptions, we can say that one of the factors that bring forth taqiya in Shi’a is, although they are from the same religion their being forced to live in the society that they do not accept its ruler, the minority psychology stemming from this. This state gives the impression that it comes from the Shi’a’s belief seeing all the Muslims apart from them as enemies. It is clear that such a taqiya perception is completely different from the *tuqah* (guarding against) expressed in the Qur’an.⁶² In fact, Zaidiya never accepted such a taqiya view, moreover it criticized strongly Imamiya and Ismailiya branch of Shi’a. But, when Zaidiya came under oppression advocated that it is possible tuqah (save one’s life) protection style.⁶³

Shi’a’s being under the psychology of defeat and efforts to establish Imamiya belief throughout history made taqiya in almost all Shi’a madhabs among the basics accepted in the basic religious principles and be accepted. As a matter of fact, there are narrations in the sources belonging to Isna Ashariya (Twelver) branch of Shi’a which claim that if a person who does not have taqiya

⁶⁰ Shayh Mufid, *Tashih al-i’tikad*, Tebriz, 1364, pp. 219-220; *Nahc al-balaga*, trs. Abdulbaki Golpinarli, Ankara 1997, p. 286; Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 9.

⁶¹ Muhammad Husain Tabatabai, *Shi’ite Islam*, p. 223.

⁶² Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, p. 9-16.

⁶³ Kamil Shaybi, “al-Taqiyya”, p. 260.

he can not be called Shi'a.⁶⁴ In another way of saying, if a person who does not act with taqiya cannot be called Shii, so abandoning taqiya is like abandoning prayer.⁶⁵ So, the intention behind the Shi'a groups meticulously advising the behavior form coming from taqiya is understood from the view ascribed to Jafar al-Sadiq "as long as Imam being an opinion matter, have a good relationship with people (enemies) externally, but oppose them from your inner self."⁶⁶ It is contemporarily explained that Jafar al-Sadiq's thought gives an impression like "he has some thoughts which others doesn't know and he doesn't want it spread through people and he has some thoughts about governing of state."⁶⁷

Since madhabs are formed, taqiya took its place in the history of madhabs as a basic behavior that makes Shi'a different from other madhabs and reflects a Shi'a person's general attitude towards people who does not share his thoughts, especially toward the current government. In another way of saying, taqiya found its most common application and legitimacy in Shi'a and be a distinct feature for Shi'a among other Islamic madhabs.⁶⁸ Therefore, not only many verses in Shi'a sources interpreted relevant taqiya,⁶⁹ but also many event like the prophet's attitude in the first 3 years of Islam, the manner of his migration to

⁶⁴ Al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 217; *Nahc al-balaga*, trs. Abdalbaki Golpinarli, p. 286; Majlisi, *Bihar al-anvar*, vol. LXXII, pp. 395-398; Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 240-242.

⁶⁵ Shayh Saduk, *Risalah al-i'tikad al-Imamiyya*, p. 127.

⁶⁶ Shayh Saduk, *Risalah al-i'tikad al-Imamiyya*, p. 127 and passim; Mirza Husain, *Müstadrak al-wasail*, Tahran 1382, vol. II, pp. 240-247.

⁶⁷ Mustafa Öz, *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Ca'fer es-Sadık", vol. II, p. 2; Ahmad al-Katib, "al-Fikr al-siyasiyyü al-Shiyyü min al-taqiyyq wa al-intizar ila al-walayay al-mutlaka", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 750-759.

⁶⁸ Ignaz Goldziher, *al-Akida wa al-sharia fi al-Islam*, p. 202; Muhammad Abdulkerim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, Daru'l-Bashir, 1987, p. 88; Musa al-Musavi, "al-Taqiya wa al-isma al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-743.

⁶⁹ Nuh 71/9; Hud 11/38; al-Saffat 37/88-89; al-Anbiya 21/60; al-Kasas 28/15, 21; al-Duhan 44/23; Shayh Saduk, *al-I'tikadat*, p. 127 and passim; Al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 219 and passim; Majlisi, *Bihar al-Anvar*, vol. LXII, p. 3 and passim.

Madina and to hold responsible Ali b. Abi Talib in his private affairs shown as examples of taqiya from the point of view of secrecy of deeds and beliefs.⁷⁰

Shi'a has claimed that some prophets mentioned in the Qur'an practiced taqiya. Actually, Prophet Abraham questioned the worship of people from his society to gods apart from Allah and to prevent this he talked to them. While informing this event, they interpreted the verse meaning "Abraham took a look at the stars and uttered, "I am uncomfortable"⁷¹ as Abraham practicing taqiya. They indicated as a proof of taqiya⁷² the verse informs that while narrating the events between Prophet Joseph and his brothers, his brothers coming into Joseph and not recognizing him, but Joseph's recognizing them.⁷³

Throughout history, Shia's enlarging the application area of taqiya so much and their fastidiousness on this matter made other Muslims to act with caution against Shia's remarks. In this context, it is noted that Shi'a Imamiya practiced taqiya in every situation whether it is necessary or not. Therefore, whenever a belief proposed by Shi'a is proven false, Shi'a stated that due to taqiya the actual belief was hidden, so a different thought declared. From all this, it came to conclusion that to determine when a Shi'a person put forth his real belief or his voicing his belief via taqiya became almost impossible.⁷⁴ In fact, Turkish researcher Mustafa Öz who drew attention to this matter stated that although taqiya is a principle to prevent possible dangers is exploited by later

⁷⁰ Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 11, 16, 44-46; For other prophet's taqiya practices see pp. 20-23; Muhammad Fawzi, *Mafhum al-taqiya fi al-Islam*, Bairut, 1405/1985, pp. 24-25; For imams' taqiya practices see Musa al-Musavi, *ibid.*, pp. 743-749.

⁷¹ al-Saffat 37/88-89.

⁷² Ihsan Ilahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 186-189.

⁷³ Yusuf 12/58.

⁷⁴ Ebu al-Barakat al-Suvaydi, *el-Hujjet al-ka'iyya li al-itifak al-firak al-Islamiyya*, pp. 28-29; Etham Ruhi Figlali, *Imamiyye Şiası*, Ankara 1984, p. 225. It is stated that in shi'te sources taqiya is allowed in every thing except drinking alcohol (nabiz), temporally getting married, and in cleaning. Al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, pp. 172, 175; vol. III, pp. 32, 380; Amili, *Vasail al-Shia*, Bairut no dated, vol. I, p. 321; vol. V, pp. 381, 458 and passim; vol. XI, p. 468; Musa al-Musavi, *ibid.*, pp. 738-749.

Shi'a groups and used for some aims such as hiding beliefs due to subjective reasons, for acting contrary to principles and not fulfilling commitments.⁷⁵

a. The Reason for Taqiya Being a Religious Obligation in Shi'a

In this way, it became an important subject for Islamic scholars how Muslims will live in such environments and determining which kind of principles in establishing their relations with society. In this context, it is extremely interesting in observing the reflections of principally the two madhabs' taking the matter of taqiya's history of development as an ideology and doctrine. Those two madhabs, as we stated earlier, came into existence as Shi'a which accepted the taqiya as a doctrinal part of the Shi'a madhab and Sunnis which appropriates the taqiya as a moral matter.⁷⁶

The principal problem in Shi'a is to determine and identify the background and reference boundaries of the taqiya attitude of a Shi'a person's determining the general boundaries of his relations with other people who does not share the same ideas with him. Why must a Shi'a person practice taqiya against other people who do not share his ideas? In another way of saying, what does a Shi'a person hides by practicing taqiya and what is the true nature of the thing which makes him afraid? Can it be taken in the same context a Shi'a person's taqiya and a Sunni person's taqiya, does this two person use taqiya as a "permission" mentioned in verses (nass) or any other sources?

⁷⁵ Mustafa Öz, *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Ca'fer es-Sadık", vol. II, p. 2; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 88-91; Ahmad al-Katib, "al-Fikr al-siyasi Shii min al-taqiya wa al-intizar ila al-walayyat al-mutlaka", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 750-759.

⁷⁶ Fazl al-Rahman, *İslam*, pp. 239-244; Ihsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, p. 143 and passim; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 88-91; Musa al-Musawi, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-749.

To find answer to these questions, what we should examine firstly is Shia's general nature and the fundamental characteristic that discriminates Shi'a from other madhabs, especially Sunni. Actually, the fundamental characteristic, which makes Shi'a different from other madhabs and gives it a definite place in the history of madhabs excepting fractions, which departed from Shi'a, will indicate us why taqiya in Shi'a has a central importance. In another way of saying, the characteristic that makes Shi'a as Shi'a is the same characteristic which causes a Shi'a person to practice taqiya against people and society who doesn't believe as he does.⁷⁷

As known, the first fundamental difference of opinion in the history of Islam occurred on the issue of who will take the ruling of Muslims after the prophet. After the demise of Islam prophet, the Arabic society who does not have a central and strong administration tradition faced its first important test.⁷⁸ Will they return to old tribal habits after the demise of prophet, or would a ruler who will take the place of prophet fulfill Muslims administrative tasks? In connection with this, which functions would this person play and would he be able to take the prophets religious and administrative tasks at the same time. A Companion of Prophet Muhammad saw the problem as a matter of who would take the place of prophet, so the debate focused on this problem. The matter they debated was not whether central administration will lose its validity, but who would replace the prophet and what would be the true nature and quality of this person's representation.

At this point, two attitudes represent the first nucleus and the first point of division for the most important debates and opinion differences in future periods of Islamic history. Many Muslims separated prophets into two

⁷⁷ Masudi, *Murucu al-zahab*, vol. II, p. 67; vol. VII, pp. 302-303; Muhammad Jawad Mugniyya, *Ma'a al-Shia al-Imamiyya*, Bairut 1956, p. 102; Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 239-243; Ahmad al-Katib, "al-Fikr al-siyasi Shii min al-taqiya wa al-intizar ila al-walayyat al-mutlaka", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 750-759; Musa al-Musawi, *ibid.*, pp. 738-749.

⁷⁸ For an evaluation in this issue and Sunni and Shi'ite attitudes towards that see: Muhammad Abid Cabiri, *Arap-İslam Kültürünün Akıl Yapısı*, p. 408 anp passim; Tabatabaî, *Shi'ite Islam*, p. 220 and passim; Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 239-243.

important roles and stated that prophethood and in connection with this the spiritual administration of community (ummah) came to an end, but on the other side "worldly management and administration" which constitutes the second part of prophet is a duty which can be executed by a qualified person from the ummah and doesn't involve any religious and spiritual authority.⁷⁹ Consequently, without seeking any inheritance or characteristic, in a partial consensus and taking into consideration as Ibn Haldun stated "Quraish tribes' solidarity power" they made their selection.⁸⁰ So, Abu Bakr is selected as the first caliph and leader of Muslims.

The most important problem facing Abu Bakr was to gather all the Muslims under his rule and, without giving a chance to dispersion and disintegration of Muslims, to keep Muslim society together. However, the first reaction came from the family of exalted prophet and people close to this family. The prophet's close family members, first of all Ali b. Abi Talib had considered that it was a rude attitude to start such a process and doing the selection of the prophet's representative without consulting them when the prophet's burial work was not completed yet. So, they rejected to recognize Abu Bakr as caliph to demonstrate their reaction. However, after a while Ali b. Abi Talib accepted the rule of Abu Bakr. Shi'ite people tried to explain his accepting of other caliphs chosen before him as the taqiya.⁸¹

Putting aside later developments, the important point here is that the first difference of opinion, which determined the two mainstream movement of the Future Islamic World, showed itself in this event. One of this two mainstream movements that represent the attitude of Abu Bakr and people who selected him

⁷⁹ Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 239-243. Cf., Musa al-Musawî, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shîa al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-749.

⁸⁰ Ibn Haldun, *Mukaddima*, trs. Zakir Kadirî Ugan, İstanbul 1988, pp. 491-495; Abdullatif al-Harpuî, *Tankîh al-kalam fi akaid-i ahl al-Islam*, trs. İbrahim Ozdamir-Fikrat Karaman, Elazig 2000, p. 304.

⁸¹ Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 240-244; İhsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nun Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 173-177.

as caliph constituted the chief reference for many madhabs, chiefly Ahl al-Sunna, who regarded the caliphate not as a religious and creed matter, but only as a worldly and administrative matter. On the other hand, because of the attitude of Ali and people around him, Shi'ite people claimed that Ali and people around him accepted the caliphate as the most important matter of Muslims instead of accepting it as a worldly affair. This claim determined the main idea of main groups who focused on the religious and worldly affairs and groups who departed from these main groups.⁸²

Truthfully, when Shi'a examined closely, it became clear that one of the main movements of Shi'a that can be inferred from its name, Imamiya, which is centered on "Imamah" (Shi'a twelver doctrine) is a madhab and all his dealings is focused on "Imamah". As Jabiri stated a Shi'a person's life turn around Imamah and Imam (religious leader).⁸³ Regarding with Imamh in shi'ite, Jabiri maintans

Every thing in Shi'ite intellectualism, like creed, philosophy, history and politics are turned around the Imam either in Ismailiyah or Imamiyah. The Shi'ite has experiences these all with Imam from spiritual point. Hence, Shi'ite is intellectual time, spiritual is esoteric time: its essential is to associate with Imam, its stages and progress levels are to rise up to Imam or levels or steps of pilgrimage. The Shi'ite cannot live spiritually without imam's existence in his heart. Most narrations revealed from Shi'ite Imams suggest and explain that. These narrations support that the imam has always existed in the heart of believers and person can only be a real believer with having constantly the light of imam in his heart. The Imam al-Baqr says: "the light of Imam in side of a

⁸² Fazl al-Rahman, *Islam*, pp. 242-244; Muhammad al-Hudari Bak, *Muhadarat tarih al-umam al-Islamiyya*, Cairo 1969, vol. II, p. 85; Corci Zaydan, *Medeniyeti İslamiye Tarihi*, trs. Zeki Magamiz, İstanbul 1328, vol. I, p. 102; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, p. 89; Musa al-Musawi, *ibid.*, pp. 738-749.

⁸³ Sönmez Kutlu, "İslam Düşüncesinde Tarihsel Din Söylemleri ", *İslâmiyât Dergisi*, Cilt: IV, Sayı: 4 (2001), s. 15-36; Musa al-Musevi, *ibid.*, pp. 743-749; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-90; Muhammad Abid Cabiri, *Arap-İslam Kültürünün Akıl Yapısı*, p. 431.

believer is shinier than sun". A Hadith saying, "Whoever did died without not acknowledging his contemporary Imam had died on the death of Ignorance" has been very popular admired in Shi'ite sources. Therefore, it is impossible to understand taqiya without understanding the place of Imamah and imam in Shi'a creed and in a Shi'a person's creed and emotional life. The most important difficulty at this point is, generally comparing with Sunni Islam, to see Imamah as a worldly ruler. In a situation like this, the real identity and importance of Shi'a and a Shi'ite person can't become clear.

Imam in Shi'a represents an obligatory piece of prophet hood, and, by having the authority of interpreting divine inspiration (Qur'anic verses), real religious authority. To tell it another way, While Sunni Islam gave the authority to interpret religion to all ummah (Muslim community) Shi'a gave this authority only to imam. In this way, by being the only person who can interpret religion, Imam took his place in the centre of Shi'a creed. For a Shi'a person, it is a fundamental religious and creedal duty to believe this imam, become a supporter when he is not absent, and while Imam is absent to wait for him and to work for his coming.⁸⁴ No administration in which there is no imam and imam's administration can be called a correct and legitimate administration for a Shi'a person.⁸⁵

The thing that compels a Shi'a person to practice taqiya in a society that does not share his belief is absolutely this belief. This Shi'a person who believes the present or absent imam, sees the society in which he lives as illegitimate and he considers this administration, in the most optimistic expression, as a tyrant and sinful administration who seized by violence the Imam's administration

⁸⁴ al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 217; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-90; Musa al-Musawi, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shîa al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-740.

⁸⁵ For further information see, Fazl al-Rahman, *İslam*, pp. 240-244. And also see: Henry Corbin, *İslam Felsefe Tarihi*, p. 39 and passim; Ahmad al-Katib, "al-Fikr al-siyasi Shîi min al-taqiya wa al-intizar ila al-walayāt al-mutlaka", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 750-759.

right. The most typical example of this is Shia's characterization of the first three caliphs who were the companions of the prophet as tyrants who, according to Shia's claim, seized the ruling right of Ali.⁸⁶

If a ruler and administration "seized violently the right of ruling and illegitimate", under this situation it is inevitable for a Shi'a person to be in quarrel and conflict with this administration. The habit of seeing present administrations as "an administration who seized ruling violently and illegitimate" forced a Shi'a person to hide his stereotyped belief of "believing imam".⁸⁷

Whereas, it is completely opposite in Sunni Islam; Sunni Islam primarily takes the matter in a more tolerable manner and generally in a reconciliation and practical attitude draws a frame in which Muslim can establish easygoing and intimate relations with the society in which he lives. In the base of Sunni Islam's this realist and pragmatic attitude lies not seeing Imamah issue as a religious problem. So, Sunni Islam generally accepts a ruler and his administration as legitimate in some cases although he uses illegal ways to come into power and does not burden a Muslim with rejecting this ruler or fighting with this ruler to "accomplish imam's coming into power".

This attitude of Sunni Islam is stated by the saying "an imam is obeyed, though he is from low-ranking people" and this saying constitutes one of the most important principles of Sunni Islamic political thought. In this way, A Sunni person, in a manner just the opposite of a Shi'a person, is not forced to make taqiya due to his not being obliged to change a political administration with another administration- e.g. imam's administration- in a society he doesn't approve.⁸⁸

⁸⁶ Kamil Shaybî, "al-Taqiyya", p. 249; Montgomery Watt, *İslam Düşüncesinin Teşekkül Devri*, trs. Ethem Ruhi Fıçlalı, p. 333; İhsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 25-34; Ahmad al-Katib, *ibid.*, pp. 750-759.

⁸⁷ Kamil Shaybî, "al-Taqiyya", p. 249 and *passim*; Fazl al-Rahman, *İslam*, pp. 242-244.

⁸⁸ Fazl al-Rahman, *İslam*, pp. 242-244. Cf., Musa al-Musawi, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-749.

Furthermore, Sunni Islam goes a step farther and determines the norms and ethics for a Muslim to have while living in a society having different beliefs. According to these norms, every Muslim should take the example of holy prophet who was described as ideal human and the best example of morality by Mushriks in a non-Muslim society and stay committed to the ethical norms even in a non-Muslim community.

3. In Ahl al-Sunna

It is seen that Ahl al-Sunnah scholars examine the taqiya concept in relation with 'ikrah' event and came into consensus that taqiya concept is a permission when faced with death threat.⁸⁹ Regarding this issue, Qurtubi (d. 671/1273) in his book of Qur'an, interpretation states that Hasan al-Basri (d. 110/728) accepted the view that protection permission like tuqah is possible for Muslims until doomsday. However, it is stated that Hasan al-Basri said that aforementioned permission is forbidden when used to seem charming and grateful to enemy.⁹⁰

Sarahsi (d. 483/1090), taking into consideration another detail, stated that a protection in 'tuqah' style can be applied not only to a non-Muslim person, but also to a tyrant person.⁹¹ From all this statement, it is understood that according to Ahl al-Sunnah sources taqiya and tuqah is not a good behavior to resort to, but it is permissible as a remedy to avoid death when faced with oppressive conditions. However, in oppressive conditions, persons who prefer torture to taqiya are deemed to worthy of praise.⁹²

⁸⁹ Ragib al-Isfahani, *al-Mufradat fi garib al-Qur'an*, edit. Muhammad Sayyid Kilani, Bairut no dated, "vky"; Kamil al-Shaybi, "al-Taqiyya", pp. 234-235; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-91; Ali Unal, *Kur'an'da Temel Kavramlar*, Istanbul 1986, p. 517; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiya* p. 9.

⁹⁰ Kurtubi, *al-Jami li ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. IV, p. 57.

⁹¹ Sarahsi, *al-Mabsut*, pp. 47-49.

⁹² al-Bakara 2/155, 207; Al-i Imran 3/186; al-Nisa 4/95; al-Tawba 9/20, 41, 120.

All the issues mentioned above shows that taqiya could not go further from being a permission in Ahl al-Sunna madhabs. Perhaps, their attitude comes from the attitudes shown by Muslims against the repetitive oppressive events in the history of Islam. In all these situations, although the conditions are proper to apply taqiya, Muslims behaved with sincerity according to their beliefs. In the oppressive events, instead of abandoning their belief in Allah in appearance and giving the enemy false information or behaving without sincerity to save themselves from oppression, Muslims' telling the truth even at the cost of their lives forced Islamic scholars to accept that taqiya is not a very proper attitude or at least it is not applicable for everyone. For this reason, Islamic scholars, being aware that such behavior will cause both psychological and sociological problems and will leave a bad and lasting image in people by way of damaging confidence feeling, never accepted the view that taqiya is an obligatory religious rule which necessitates obeying.⁹³

Likewise, some Muslims in Mecca period, which involves the first years of Islam, endured some pressure and torture from leading Mecca idolaters to turn back from their beliefs. Mecca idolaters forced them to believe their idols instead of Allah, consequently to act with idolaters instead of exalted prophet. It is known that Mecca idolaters used unbearable torture to people who accepted oneness of Allah.

In spite of some Muslims' being forced to accept idolaters' beliefs by being thrown into the fire and Muslims' never turning back from their belief is interpreted as taqiya being not an obligatory command, or to say it in another way people who do not use taqiya can not be blamed for acting against religion. Again, although Bilal al-Habashi's being left on hot sands in agony and his being dragged on hot sands, but his refusal to their demands and preferring belief in Allah and Sumayya who was the first martyr in the history of Islam

⁹³ For example see Ebu al-Barakat al-Suwaydi, *al-Hujjat al-ka'iyya li al-itifak al-firak al-Islamiyya*, Egypt 1323, pp. 28-29; Muhammad Abdulkarim Atum, *al-Nazariyya al-siyasiyya al-muasira li al-Shia al-Imamiyya al-Isna Ashariyya*, pp. 89-91.

refusing their demand to believe in other gods until death under torture of Abu Jahil supports this issue.⁹⁴

It is thought that to show patience and not practicing taqiya under these conditions is a better attitude for the future of religion and society. In this respect, permission was given for the people who face life threat in the first years of Islam to practice taqiya with tongue as a natural human right. However, this people's declaring their belief in Allah is also stated as a more pleasing behaviour. Nevertheless, it is stated that no matter what the situation is taqiya can never be made in affairs based on the performance of religious duties like killing of a Muslim, regarding forbidden as religiously lawful or helping a non-Muslim person.⁹⁵

On the other side, to prefer death by refusing denial (qufr) under life threatening situations which will break the determination of unbelievers and defeat them psychologically; to save all the Muslims from all fears except the fear of Allah, so in this way Muslims who prefer the hard way which is to prefer not to obey unbelievers and give their lives for this cause are not condemned, but praised for doing what need to be done.⁹⁶ In this context, it should not be forgotten Allah's declaration that Allah will not burden his slaves with things,

⁹⁴ Jassas, *Ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. II, p. 10; Fahraddin al-Razi, *Tafsir*, trs. Suat Yıldırım et al., Ankara 1989, vol. VI, p. 252; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, pp. 121-122; Elmalili, *Hak Dini*, vol. II, p. 1074; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 28-30; For a similar narration see: Al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, II, 175.

⁹⁵ Jassas, *Ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. II, pp. 9-10; Ibn Hayyan, *Bahr al-muhit*, vol. II, pp. 423-424; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, pp. 122-126.

⁹⁶ It is stated that this situation is well indicated by the episode of Musaylamah al-Kazzab He captured two sahabas and when he asked one his opinion about Muhammad, took the answer in favour of his prophet hood. When he asked if he is prophet, the sahaba answer affirmatively and he saved his life. However, the other sahaba answer the first question in favor. In the second question, when he hesitate to answer by saying that he is disable to hear him he was murdered. When the prophet heard about the story said: "the first used the facilitate Allah gave him the second declared his faith, happy for him!" For example see Fahraddin al-Razi, *Tafsir*, trs. Suat Yıldırım et al., vol. VI, p. 252; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, pp. 121-122; Elmalili *Hak Dini*, vol. II, p. 1074; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya* pp. 28-30. For a similar narration see: al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 175.

which they can not afford.⁹⁷ In this respect, permission was given for a Muslim to speak as he was told to do by his oppressors to save himself from the agony of torture he is undergoing on the condition of preserving his belief in his heart against Allah and his Messenger in a psychological and physical torture situation. According to this if a person, to save himself from his enemies who torture him, accepts denial (qufr) by his tongue, but not his heart; punishment is not required for him. Because, Allah judges his slaves by their beliefs in their hearts.⁹⁸

Likewise, it is reported in the sources that Ammar b. Yasir whose father Yasir and mother Sumayya became martyries under torture was faced with the same death threat, he could not endure anymore, and by repeating Mushriks' remarks, he saved his life. Ammar b. Yasir feeling the penitence in his conscience for his behavior came to the Prophet Muhammad crying and told him, "O! Messenger of Allah, they did not let me free without talking unpleasantly about you and praising their idols" and he apologized for this. Therefore, the exalted prophet asked him about what he felt truly in his heart at that moment. Ammar responded that he had never abandoned his belief in Allah and the Messenger of Allah. It is reported in the sources that Prophet Mohammad, probably to free Ammar from the psychological situation he is undergoing, relieved him by telling that when faced with a situation like that in future he should act in the same way as he acted before.⁹⁹ As you see, this behavior that is stated as a 'tuqah' way in Qur'an is allowed to avoid an open death threat.

Besides, it is reported that the verse meaning, "a person whose heart is calmed with belief is saved when forced to deny his belief. However, people who do not recognize Allah and open their hearts to qufr after believing, Allah's

⁹⁷ al-Maida 5/6; Taha 20/2; al-Hac 22/78; al-Nur 24/61; al-Ahzab 33/37-38; al-Bakara 2/286.

⁹⁸ See Al-i Imran 3/29; Qurtubi, *al-Jami li ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. III, p. 58; R. Strothmann, *MEB İslam Ansiklopedisi*, "Takiya".

⁹⁹ Ibn Kathir, *Tafsir*, vol. II, p. 24; vol. XX, p. 122; Tabari, *Jami al-bayan*, vol. XIV, pp. 112-113; Jassas, *Ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. II, p. 10; Tabatabai, *ibid.*, pp. 223-224; Elmalili, *Hak Dini*, vol. II, p. 1074; Makarim Shirazi, *Taqiyya*, pp. 27-30.

wrath will be upon them and a great suffering awaits them. This is for their preferring this world to the next world and Allah takes not a denying community to true path"¹⁰⁰ clarifies this situation.

However, it is called to attention the last part of the verse and this verse is used as a proof on the issue of giving permission for weak Muslims to have good relations with Mushriks to avoid their fatal tortures on the condition of these weak Muslims protecting their belief in their hearts. The verse, which reminds that final return, would be to Allah shows that showing patience and protecting belief in Allah in every situation is a more pleasant behavior.¹⁰¹

According to this, it is understood that the permission under consideration is valid only for the Muslims who cannot resist the harm, which will occur to the things they give value. However, Allah reminds them that they actually need to fear him and ask them "to prefer the difficult one." In fact, this situation is openly called to attention in the verse meaning "O Muslims! Neither makes friends with the people, coming from the people who were given book before, who play and make fun of your religion, nor make friends with other unbelievers. Fear Allah if you are true believers."¹⁰²

For the Muslims who are in this situation, they are asked to show self-sacrifice in proportion to their power about Allah's religion. In reality, the expected behavior and the highest degree of faith is this.¹⁰³ Despite all this facts, it is stated in Ahl al-Sunna understanding that to protect confidence system and not to cause moral dangers, taqiya is never permissible to use as a means of sycophancy or flattery. Because, all these sycophant behaviors are not involved in 'tuqah' that is allowed for protection, just the opposite these behaviors are forbidden nifaq (discordance) and hypocrisy. Moreover, it is stated that it is not

¹⁰⁰ al-Nahl, 16/106, 107.

¹⁰¹ Al-i Imran, 3/28.

¹⁰² al-Maide, 5/57.

¹⁰³ For example see al-Bakara 2/214; Al Imran 3/28; al-Maide 5/57; al-Nahl 16/106, 107; al-Maide 5/57.

permissible to make taqiya against unbelievers and other people to avoid minor harms, because taqiya is permissible only to save oneself from death, mutilation, and violence torture. It is stated also that it is not permissible to act with taqiya against minor dangers or to profit some simple personal gains.¹⁰⁴

4. Attitude of Ahl al-Sunna and The refusal of taqiya Application in Shi'a

Ahl al-Sunna took up the 'Tuqah' way protection problem from a different perspective, emphasized in which situation and in, which condition it can be used as a "temporary attitude". In this context, we should state that Ahl al-Sunna consider that 'the protection' is possible only when faced with death threat. As a matter of fact, the word 'Tuqah's usage in "Nas's" has primarily such a background.¹⁰⁵ The first friends of Messenger of Allah endured great suffering from the Mushrik community; some of them were subjected to death and the most severe tortures for the sake of their beliefs. Actually, this situation is seen as a general fate for the birth stage of all religions. As a matter of fact, Qur'an mentions the life stories of people who endured great sufferings and risked their lives for the sake of religion as an example and model. Qur'an also prohibited telling lie.¹⁰⁶

Exalted prophet gave permission to accept Mushriks' beliefs in such conditions when a person's life is in danger. To give it an example, we can give the attitude of two Muslims who were captured by Mushriks. The Messenger of Allah's praising the attitude of person who was martyred and stating that risking

¹⁰⁴ Bagavi, *Tafsir*, vol. I, p. 292; Ibn Hayyan, *Tafsir*, vol. II, p. 424; Alusi, *Ruh al-Maani*, vol. III, pp. 121-123; Elmalili, *Hak Dini*, vol. II, pp. 1072-1074; Hayrettin Karaman, *İslam'ın Işığında Günün Meseleleri*, İstanbul 1982, vol. I, p. 235; İhsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 185-190.

¹⁰⁵ Al-i İmran 3/28; al-Nahl 16/106; al-Mu'min 40/28.

¹⁰⁶ al-Maide 5/67; al-Tawba 9/119; al-Hacc 22/30; al-Ahzab 33/39; For details see Fazl al-Rahman, *İslam*, p. 241; İhsan İlahi Zahir, *Şia'nın Kur'an İmamet ve Takiyye Anlayışı*, pp. 140-142, 147-151.

one's life for the sake of one's religion is more virtuous, shows a different dimension of the matter in Ahl al-Sunna.¹⁰⁷

Ahl al-Sunna, moving ahead from this event, emphasized that it is only permissible to act with an attitude like 'Tuqah' when faced with death, but real virtue lies with declaring one's belief in every condition. Ahl al-Sunna, in this context, accepts in a realistic attitude that people depending on their abilities and capabilities can show different reactions. It is stated that at least scholars who give direction to society, scientist and leaders of community should never accept taqiya in whatever situation they are. It is accepted that such an attitude is an advice and virtue. The typical example for this is Ahmed b. Hanbal (died in 241/855) who refused to abandon his belief or hide his view by using taqiya against Abbasid administration's severe pressure. Ahmed b. Hanbal didn't think to change his view in spite of all the pressures, tortures and death threats on the issue of whether Qur'an is created or not created, which is one of the oldest problems of the history of madhabs and Kelam.

At this point, Ahmed b. Hanbal refused his students' and his friends' numerous suggestions and proposals by stating that a Muslim scholar doesn't have the right to hide his thought and belief by way of taqiya.¹⁰⁸ It is reported that he said "If Muslim scholars speak by practicing taqiya and ignorant speak because of his ignorance in the way as they are asked to do, when will come out the truth".¹⁰⁹

Muhammad Ebu Zehra (1898/1974) claimed that a person who has great degree in hadith and fatva can't abandon his duty of commanding goodness and guarding against evil, Imams who are followed can't act with taqiya by using

¹⁰⁷ Jassas, *Ahkam al-Qur'an*, vol. II, p. 10; Fahraddin al-Razi, *Mafatih al-gayb*, vol. VI, p. 252; Alusi, *Ruh al-maani*, vol. III, pp. 121-122; Elmalili, *Hak Dini*, vol. II, p. 1074. For similar hearsays see al-Kulayni, *al-Kafi*, vol. II, p. 175.

¹⁰⁸ Muhammad Ebu Zahra, *Islam'da Fikhi Mezhepler Tarihi*, trs. Abdulkadir Şener, İstanbul, 1983, pp. 381-382.

¹⁰⁹ Ebu Hayyan, *Tafsir*, vol II, p. 424; Kamil Shaybi, "al-Taqiyya" p. 246 and passim; Ahmad Muhammad Shakir, *Dairat al-Ma'arif al-Islamiyya*, "al-Taqiyya".

states, acts and statements as a proof, otherwise it would not be possible for the community to know their imam's real view and the community would think that their imam's all statements are true and the community would be mistaken and by this way great confusion would occur.¹¹⁰

As a matter of fact, Dihlawi (died in 1176/1762) states that, it is not possible for the Imams to make taqiya due to fear. According to Dihlawi, fear that necessitates taqiya is divided into two. The first fear is the fear of staying alive and this fear is not valid for the imam for two reasons.¹¹¹ Mainly, imams know when they will die in Shi'a belief. The second reason is that imams equipped with the ability to know events past and future. Imams know how and when they will die. For this reason, it is clear that they don't need to make taqiya due to their having no reason to fear before death angel came to them.¹¹² The second fear can result from being subject to material and psychological behaviors like torture, insult, and humiliation. It is leadership position's necessity to endure all these sufferings with patience for every scholar and imam. In fact, many examples of this can be found in the books of history involving Shi'a resources.¹¹³ For this reason, the claim that Ali b. Ebu Talib's, who was famous for his courage, obeying to three caliphs coming before him by way of taqiya due to fear means to deny his feature of courage.

V. Conclusion

Taqiya is the name of hiding belief against a great fear. This attitude showed itself in different rays of color in the history of Islamic madhabs, but it became a distinctive feature of Shi'a. In this regard, taqiya is an attitude that is identical with Shi'a. The reason for this is, as we mentioned before, Shi'a's taking the *Imamet* view as the fundamental principle and declaring other

¹¹⁰ M. Ebu Zahra, *İslam'da Fikhi Mezhepler Tarihi*, pp. 381-382.

¹¹¹ Al-Kulayni, *al-Qafi*, vol. I, p. 258. Cf., Musa al-Musawi, "al-Taqiya wa al-ismat al-imama inda Shia al-Imama", *Milletlerarası Tarihte ve Günümüzde Şiilik Sempozyumu*, pp. 738-749.

¹¹² Abdulaziz al-Dihlawi, *Muhtasar al-tuhfa al-Isna-Ashariyya*, edit. Muhibbu al-din al-Hatib, 1387.

¹¹³ Tabarsi, *al-Ihtijaj ala ahl al-hujaj*, Iran 1302, p. 45 and passim; Rawandi, *Kitab al-Haraij wa al-jaraih*, Bombay no dated, p. 20; Shayh Saduk, *al-Hisal*, Tahran 1320, pp. 105-106.

political rules illegitimate. Whereas, the protection which is stated in Qur'an as *Tuqah* is a completely different application. As a matter of fact, Ahl al-Sunna didn't accept such a belief. For the reason that a sunni Muslim's belief is not based upon a condition which necessitates to illegitimize a community or administrations in any way, he doesn't have a belief to hide by making taqiya and he doesn't have any reason to force him make taqiya.

Beyond all these, it should be noted that attention was drawn to greatness of taqiya's moral dangers. It should not be ignored that taqiya effects relations between countries negatively; taqiya being made groundlessly causes a continual environment of distrust and doubt among people and taqiya effects cultural relations negatively. Besides, it is a fact that fastidiousness of the people, who imbibe taqiya, on taqiya issue causes their words to be encountered with caution and destructs trust environment. For this reason, taqiya is not counted among religious principles by followers of Ahl al-Sunna who constitute a great part of Islamic world.