

S A Y I 21 • 2 0 0 9

İslâm

Araştırmaları

Dergisi

TURKISH JOURNAL OF ISLAMIC STUDIES



arařtırma yapmak isteyenlere farklı ülkeler hakkında giriş niteliğinde bilgiler sađlamasından dolayı deđerli bir çalıřma olarak kabul edilebilir.

Ayře Zıřan Furat

Jihad in Islamic History: Doctrine and Practices

Michael Bonner

Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006. 198 pages.

Jihad in Islamic History by the fine historian Michael Bonner is the English version of *Le jihad, origins, interprétations, combats* published by Téraèdre in 2004. The aim of the book is to provide a short book as introduction to the doctrine and practices of *jihad* and, more specifically, to the origins of *jihad* within the broader history of Islam (p. xv).

The first chapter is a first brief introduction to *jihad* but mainly draws the borders of the field of debate among Muslim jurists and political actors over the centuries. In fact the intention of the author is to portray the origins of *jihad* as a series of events covering all the broad extent of Islamic history. For this Muslims have employed a shared idiom, derived from the Quran, from the various narratives of origins, from the classical doctrine of *jihad*, and from their shared experience. However, their ways of doing this have been quite diverse: not mere repetitions or re-enactments of the first founding moment but new foundations arising in a wide variety of circumstances (p. 17).

The following two chapters attempt to analyse the doctrine of *jihad* through the Muslim classical sources: the Quran and the narratives of origins. The second chapter makes a consideration of the themes relating to warfare and *jihad* in the Quranic text. The following chapter is focused about the narrative about *jihad* in the early Muslim community through *hadith*, *sira* and *maghazi*. Here and in the fourth chapter there is a handy introduction for neophytes to the scholarly debates in the West on the origins of the 'sacred history' and the *hadith* literature. The fourth chapter give also space to the great expansion of the Islamic Empire and its interpretation by Western authors.

Chapter five is dedicated to explain the concept of martyrdom through the early sources and then historically. The following chapter is devoted to the treatment of conquered societies; namely the religious freedoms and the fiscal regime of non-Muslim populations that were conquered by Islamic armies

during the great expansion in the early centuries of Islamic history. The author views are quite favourable of Muslim dominations and he compares it with *Convivencia* in Spain after the *Reconquista*, which unfortunately did not demonstrate the same tolerance of Muslim authorities.

The chapter 'Embattled Scholars' examines how the doctrine of *jihad* was intended throughout the centuries in different areas of the Muslim lands. Here is evident how interpretations are influenced by tensions that had been breeding among various contending parties that included the leader and other representatives of the Islamic state, who needed to mobilize armies so as to defend and, where possible, expand the territory of Islam.

Chapter eight is the longer section of the book and is dedicated to a historical overview of the early centuries of Islam and the different interpretations and use of the doctrine of *jihad* from the emergence of the Umayyad state to the emergence of the Ottoman Empire. Bonner demonstrates in this chapter not only a good knowledge of early Islamic history but also a capacity of synthesis. However, the space dedicated to the Ottoman Empire appears too concise, considering the extent and the relevance of the Ottoman era and the political, economic and international challenges that the Empire had to face. Those challenges inevitably influenced the understanding of the doctrine of *jihad* and the numerous scholarly debates. Other important Islamic eras and geographies are not even mentioned. For instance, there is no reference throughout the book of the Mughâl Empire and the Indian subcontinent, also crucial pages of Islamic history and the evolution of Islamic jurisprudence.

In a period when there is so much talking of *jihad*, its dreadful misinterpretations, and its interpreters in the international media and in the academia such an equilibrate introduction is welcome. However, the book may represent a disappointment for those who would like to understand the doctrine and interpretations of *jihad* in the contemporary world. Indeed only the relatively small chapter nine is dedicated to the period that stretches from Napoleon expedition to Egypt passing through the emergence of modern states in the Middle East to nowadays. Only four pages are dedicated to the contemporary evolutions and interpretations of the doctrine of *jihad*. Nevertheless, this is exactly what the common reader would probably be interested in today. Maybe a different and more precise title might have avoided any disappointment or misunderstanding.

In the preface, Michael Bonner acknowledges his intention to concentrate his work on the early period of Islam and -as he writes- 'it is there that my own contributions and ideas stand the best chance of being considered origi-

nal, and perhaps even right' (p. xvii). Bonner has been very successful in preparing an introduction to the doctrine and practices of *jihad* in early Islamic history that can initiate students to the first period Islamic history and early interpretations of *jihad*. Moreover, there is also a useful commented bibliography at the end of each chapter useful for further readings in the major European languages.

Michelangelo Guida

Les derviches tourneurs: doctrine, histoire et pratiques

Alberto Fabio Ambrosio, Ève Feuillebois, Thierry Zarccone

Paris: Cerf, 2006. 212 sayfa.

Üç yazarın hazırladığı *Les derviches tourneurs*, düzenli ve düzgün sunumu olan Fransızca bir Mevlevîliğe giriş kitabıdır. Kitabın hazırlanış öyküsüne değinilen "Giriş" kısmından sonra, "Birinci Bölüm"de Mevlânâ'nın yaşamöyküsü ve yapıtı (Feuillebois), "İkinci Bölüm"de Mevlevîliğin gelişimi (Zarccone) ve son bölümde de başta semâ âyini, daha doğrusu mukabele anlatılıyor (Ambrosio). Üç sayfalık bir "Sonuç"tan sonra ayrıntılı bir "Bibliyografya" (s. 177-194) ve iki ayrı "Dizin"le (kişi ve yer isimleri; kavramlar) kitap tamamlanıyor. Fransa'da konuyla ilgili geniş kitleye yönelik son yapıtların 1970'li yıllarda Eva de Vitray-Meyerovitch'in elinden çıkanlar olduğu anımsanırsa, bundan önce D. Gimaret ve S. Ruspoli gibi İslâmiyat uzmanlarının da yayıncısı olan dinler tarihinde uzmanlaşmış Cerf Yayınevi'nin girişiminin yerindeliği anlaşılır.

XIII. yüzyıl İrânî tasavvuf geleneği ve şiirinin uzmanı Ève Feuillebois'nın sunduğu Mevlânâ'nın yaşamöyküsü (s. 15-31), siyasî, iktisadî ve toplumsal bağlam bütünüyle göz ardı edilmiş olduğundan ve üstelik yeni bakış açılarını ve bilgilerden yararlanılmadığından kuru bir anlatım olarak kalmış. Yazar, Mevlânâ'nın yapıtını ele aldığı sayfalarda (s. 32-42) önce *Mesnevî* ve *Dîvân-ı Kebîr*'i Vitray-Meyerovitch'in şiir çevirilerinden geniş alıntılarla okurlarına tanıtıyor ve üç paragrafla da *Fihî mâ fih* ve *Mektûbât*'tan söz ediyor. "Birinci Bölüm"ün son sayfalarında (s. 62-81) Feuillebois, Mevlânâ'nın şiirlerindeki ana mazmunlara ve tarzlara (ör. şathiyeler) yer veriyor ve *Mesnevî* şairinin İran şiir geleneğinde, özellikle kendi çağındaki yerini belirliyor. Ancak yazar ondan önce, Mevlânâ'nın tasavvufî görüşlerini ele alıyor (s. 42-62). Gerçi, ele alıyor diye nitelenmek bile belki de fazla olacak; çünkü burada ağırlıklı olarak